Human Trafficking and Modern Day Slavery

The health needs of trafficked and enslaved people

A technology solution to end trafficking in the construction industry

Effect of human trafficking on the mental health of victims
Children Of Commercial Sex Workers (CSWs)
Male labor exploitation: voices from Ukraine
Anti-oppressive Practice in Anti-trafficking Interventions in Nepal

Develop a social justice framework to support migrant sex workers
Diversity of Organizational Responses to Human Trafficking on the United States’ Border with Mexico
Rural Human Prevention Intervention Analysis
Contents

From the President 2
Editor-in-chief Carolyn Noble 4
Guest editor Doris Testa 5
The health needs of trafficked and enslaved people – a social response 6
The Global Subcontractor Registry: A technology solution to end trafficking in the construction industry 10
Social norms and child trafficking: A springboard for social workers to facilitate community-based child protection interventions 16
Rural Human Prevention Intervention Analysis 20
Diversity of Organizational Responses to Human Trafficking on the United States’ Border with Mexico 23
Anti-oppressive Practice in Anti-trafficking Interventions in Nepal 26
How to develop a social justice framework to support migrant sex workers and prevent the harm caused by anti-trafficking initiatives 30
Attitude of Women and Girls to Child Trafficking Prevention Programmes in Bodija Market, Ibadan, Nigeria. 35
Domestic trafficking of children in Ethiopia 38
The experience of male labor exploitation: voices from Ukraine 43
Children Of Commercial Sex Workers (CSWs): Understanding Vulnerabilities To Undermine Them 46
The effect of human trafficking on the mental health of victims 50
Human Trafficking and Forced Labour in Uzbekistan 53
Why the high figures of sex-work migrants in Edo State, Nigeria? Considerations for social work practice 56
Human trafficking as a global illegal and unethical business practice: an overview of the phenomenon and the role of social work in Greece 59
Social integration of victims of human trafficking in Bosnia and Herzegovina 62
Self-employment program as a socially-oriented project in the development of human resources 65
Dear colleagues,

It is a great pleasure to introduce this volume that is focusing on Human trafficking and modern slavery. Social work needs to pay more attention to this phenomenon and work at different levels: to acknowledge the global factors that contribute to determine it and support the victims of this process. As always Social Dialogues will offer reflections and experiences that will be helpful in introducing our students into this topic.

Thank you to all those who have contributed to this 20th edition of this value publication.

Let me also take some space to let you know what IASSW has been up to in its mission to further social work education across the globe.

Dublin Conference—July 2018

First of all is important to quote the Dublin conference and the connected General Assembly. The participation of IASSW members has been very large. In our booth, thank to the work of Lynn Healey and Rashmi Pandey a presentation of the 90 years of IASSW history was displayed. A book that collects the Younghusband lectures (edited by Carolyn Noble) was also presented and sold.

During the conference, Prof. Dr Mel Gray presented the Eileen Younghusband lecture and Prof. Dr. Marida Yamamoto (Brazil) the Katherine Kendall award lecture.

The results of the election of the Treasurer and 2 members at large were announced. For the 4 years term- 2018-2022, Prof. Tan Ngoh Tiong (Singapore) will cover the role of Treasurer and Prof. Augusta Yetunde Olaore (Nigeria) and Prof. Shajahan P. K. (India) will participate to the Board as Member –at-large. While we congratulate these new entries, we want to thank Prof. Mark Henrikson, Prof. Linda Kreitzer and Prof. Hernando Munoz for the contribution that they have given to our Association.

The assembly has expressed its appreciation for the work done by the President, the Officers and the Board in this difficult period and given mandate to continue in this direction.

Both IASSW and IFSW General Assembly had approved the Ethical Principles, prepared by the joint task force (IASSW-IFSW) although in a brief version. We have uploaded a larger version translated in the 5 languages on the website. It has been a long process, but finally
we got an interesting document, thanks to the incredible effort of Chair Prof. Vishanthie Sewpaul and all the task force members. Now we expect that in any school will be a discussion of the document and that we look at this document as a working paper that can be expanded at regional or national level and we would like that feedback will be discussed in the next conference in Rimini 2020.

A new task force will now work on the revision process of the Global Standard of Social Work Education.

A very important step toward a stronger and loyal cooperation at tripartite level with IFSW and ICSW has been the election of the new President Silvana Martinez from Argentina. Together we have discussed the future of our common engagement and decided that the three Presidents will all be present at both the conference in 2020 in Rimini and in Calgary.

Rimini Conference-June 2020

As you all must be aware of that 2020 conference will be organised in two different locations: Rimini 28/6-1/7 by IASSW and ICSW with the title: Promoting Human Relationship: Bridging the future! (www.swesd2020.org) and in Calgary by IFSW in July. The Rimini conference will be focused on social work education and social policy, so we hope that there will be a larger space for our academics to share ideas and discuss about curricula, teaching methodologies, researches! We have circulated a request to consider Sponsorship opportunities. We hope that you would be active partner in supporting the organizers to find good sponsors!!!

IASSW Board Meeting-January 2019

In Tokyo IASSW had organized the Annual Board Meeting (11/13 January 2019) with the great support of Prof. Junko Wake and the Japanese Association of Schools of social work.

Many important decisions have been taken to enhance the effectiveness and the efficacy of our organization: moving a financial management to a cheaper option, create fund raising opportunities, revamp the website, consider the possibility to hire a person to assist the organization in the public communication and strategic priorities.

Reports and programs of the different committees have been discussed. Once more we invite every member who would like to contribute more actively to joint in the activities. We need more people committed in developing a strong educator’s community to enhance the excellence in social work education.

Tripartite Meeting- February 2019

During the Tripartite meeting in London (3/4 February2019) the future of the Global Agenda has been discussed with David Jones and there was an agreement on how to proceed to collect the Reports of the 4th Pillar Promoting Human Relationship that will be the Leitmotif of 2019/2020 World Social Work Days and how to start the process to develop the new Global Agenda. Abey Tasse has been proposed by IASSW as a future coordinator of the 2020/2030 initiative and all the partner have accepted. Together with ICSW we have launched a FB page: https://www.facebook.com/Rimini2020/ and a dedicated address: iaic.globalagenda@gmail.com where you can send your suggestions. This is a very important process, so please involve your students and your colleagues in sending ideas and feedback.

Request to participate: IASSW – World Census of Social Work Education Programs – 2020 Directory

Every ten years, the International Association of Schools of Social Work (IASSW) conducts a world census of social work education programs offering at least one degree program in social work.

The major outcome of the census is a directory of contact details for all social work education programs in the world.

In the year 2000, the directory contained details of 1384 programs from 114 countries and in 2010 it grew to include 2110 social work degree sites in 125 countries.

By 2020 we are aiming to include every social work training institution in the world.

We need your help so that we can include as many social work training institutions in the world as possible.


More activities

• Coming to the other activities that has been realised in this period, as President I’ve been invited in different conferences. I’ve spent September/October in Chile, Colombia and Argentina, meeting colleagues of the Latin America Region and inviting them to become IASSW members.

• Very interesting was the discussion with representatives of INACAP, a Chile university that has 18 social work programs in the country. They are now submitting a proposal to have a program evaluation by IASSW.

• In November I was invited in China for the 30th anniversary of the reestablishment of social work program in China and at Peking University. Discussion with Professor Wang Ying, Prof. Angie Yuen and Prof. Lena Dominelli resulted in a proposal of capacity building program for MSW teachers that will be organised in November 2019.

• In December I participated as chair of the jury to the discussion of the first Master thesis in Brazzaville, where a Social Work school has been created with the support of the former IASSW President Abye Tasse and Emmanuel Jovelin from Lille University (France). Looking forward to continue our cooperation, all my best wishes.
Editor-in-chief
Carolyn Noble

Social work is most often charged with dealing with the world's social problems as unchecked Global capital engages in its endless search for more profits leaving a trail of human and economic disasters behind. One pressing disaster is the international slave trade; a growing problem of increasing ‘epidemic proportions’ which is emerging on social works’ ‘must attend too’ list. Over the last decade trafficking in human beings has become transnational and fluid in character where no country is exempt (Hodge & Lietz, 2007; www.antislavery.com). Human trafficking is a process of enslaving people (often against their will or by deception) and coercing them into a situation with no way out and exploiting them as much as humanly possible without any regard for their wellbeing or basic humanity.

Human trafficking is part of the shadow economy, involving women and young girls and men and young boys. They are trafficked for sexual services, for child marriages and domestic slavery, for forced criminality such as running drugs and contraband, for begging and organ removals, for supply chain work and cheap exploited labour leading to a lifetime of abuse and appalling treatment and living conditions. Of those trafficked internationally 70% of women and 50% of children are purely for sexual exploitation (Quirk, 2011; Hodge & Lietz, 2007). Understanding this phenomenon requires knowledge of the push/pull factors as well as geo-political, military, social and economic global relations. It is an indictment on us (or anyone) that such activity occurs yet alone seems to be on the increase.

Escaping slavery is an enormous challenge as is identifying it especially in the industrial world where such practices would seem to have been overcome with antislavery activism and national and international laws designed to prevent and protect. This leaves social work with several issues. First is how to identify the practice and the victims and perpetrators involved, second, how to tackle it and third, how to respond to the human toll it creates, physically, mentally, socially and economically and finally how to reintegrate those trafficked back into society and family after their experiences/ordeal.

All the articles in this edition acknowledge that social work has paid little attention to this issue either nationally and internationally despite the growing number of exposed cases and instances of abuse and explosion in the press and social media outlets. This collection from across the globe is part of social work's awakening to such practices and hopefully will also be part of seeking solutions for helping people trapped in appalling conditions for which, now there is little hope of escape. For those who do manage to escape social work can play an important role in helping to end these practices and assist survivors by a multilevel approach that includes activism, policy changes, community interventions (such as education, awareness campaigns and drawing attention to the push/pull factors) and direct practice dealing with the trauma, and physical, family and psychological effects. Once again a big thank you to all the contributors!

References
What is Human Trafficking? www.antislavery.com
Social work has a significant role to play in responding to human trafficking and modern day slavery (“trafficking”). Regardless of the form of exploitation experienced, people who are trafficked suffer intense abuse and suffer adverse and multiple inter-related health impacts and cumulative physical, reproductive, developmental, behavioural and psychological health problems that interact with the personal, social-environmental, and contextual systemic factors specific to the trafficked person.

As you will read in the submissions in this issue, human trafficking crosses global and local borders and thus needs global and local responses. Understanding the complexities of trafficking encompasses understanding the personal, social and political constructs that ultimately frame the awareness of, attitudes to and actions taken to underpin social work practice. Eradicating trafficking brings social workers face to face with human rights violations and compels them to understand the “push and pull” of the trafficking industry, estimated to involve 21 million people worldwide, is ranked as the third largest source of income for organised crime, and reaps an annual profit of $32 million to trafficking agents a $150 billion criminal enterprise.

This issue of Social Dialogue offers opportunity for social workers to situate themselves in local initiatives that have global impacts. Contributors offer insight into how social work practice and research is proactively focussed on the social determinants of trafficking, with the goal of modifying the very environments and settings that predispose vulnerable individuals to becoming trafficked. Focussing on prevention and intervention and restoring wellbeing, contributors address micro, meso and macro practices that go beyond treatment to areas of empowerment, advocacy and reform.

Importantly we hear the voices of the trafficked, offered in trust to a profession that prides itself in seeking “social change and development, social cohesion, and the empowerment and liberation of people” and the “Principles of social justice, human rights, collective responsibility and respect for diversities”.

I commend the articles included in this special issue to social work practitioners, educators and policy advocates for consideration and thoughtful, informed action. A special thankyou to Carolyn Noble, Editor in Chief, for her encouragement and trust in helping to compile this special issue on Human Trafficking and Modern Day Slavery.

Doris Testa is a Senior Lecturer at Victoria University, Melbourne
This study, part of a larger study undertaken within an Australian, Victorian hospital, examined the experiences of eighteen social workers situated within one of St Vincent’s Health Australia’s facilities, and reports the social workers’ knowledge of, experience with, and identification of trafficked (HT) or enslaved persons (EN). The results indicated that social workers were unable to confidently identify trafficked persons and did not have the skills and knowledge needed to identify and treat trafficked persons. The findings contribute to achieving systemic change in the Australian healthcare community and to social work practice, so that the needs of those affected by human trafficking can be more strategically addressed within the health sector.

The invisibility of trafficked and enslaved persons
Although no Australian data exists for how many HT or EN persons come into contact with the Australian health care system, Kovacic (2018), investigating the America context, estimates that approximately 13% to 88% of American trafficked victims have come into contact with a health care provider during their enslavement. Baldwin et al’s (2011) estimates as many as 30% to 50% of victims have come into contact with a health care provider during their time in captivity, however HT or EN persons remain largely unidentified when interacting with the health system (Davy, 2015; Lederer & Wetzel, 2014; Recknor, Gemeinhardt, & Selwyn, 2017).

HT or EN persons presenting at a health care facility may not report their experiences because of their distrust of authority (Dovydaitis, 2010), feelings of guilt or shame, a sense of complicity; fear of judgmental treatment; threats of physical harm by the trafficker;
fear of retaliation against loved ones; fear of deportation; and, in the case of minors, fear of being reported and returned to an abusive home (Baldwin et al., 2011). Health workers may also contribute to the HT or EN person's invisibility within the health system. International literature attributes the health providers’ limited understanding and education of the complexity of trafficking and enslavement and their unawareness of the patient characteristics that may indicate trafficking or enslavement (Gibbons & Stoklosa, 2016; Helton, 2016; Kovacic, 2018; Recknor et al., 2017; Titchen et al., 2015). Where identification was acknowledged, the media and the stereotypes propagated by the media, was attributed as the main source of information (Gregoriou & Ras, 2018; Larsen. & Renshaw., 2012)

Identification and treatment of trafficked persons - what works

Ahn et al (2013) concluded that a robust healthcare workforce that is aware of the health impact of this issue; educated about how to identify and treat affected individuals in a compassionate, culturally aware, and trauma-informed manner; and trained about how to collaborate efficiently with law enforcement, case management, and advocacy partners enables a healthcare workforce to become an active, vital partner in human trafficking identification, intervention, and prevention.

Kovacic (2018), researching the pivotal role played by health providers in the identification, treatment and support of trafficked persons, argues strongly that identifying victims of human trafficking should be integral to the practice of taking a patient's health history. Her research, building on other’s research into health workers’ identification, treatment and support of trafficked persons, and subsequent development of the instrument measuring U.S. health care provider’s knowledge regarding human trafficking, confirmed that education and training were crucial in the capacity building of health worker skills and knowledge.

Similarly, several international researchers, to date none in Australia, have documented practices that support the identification and treatment of trafficked persons. For example, Schwarz et al (2016), exploring the American Emergency context-specific practices and protocols adopted in the University of Kansas Hospital, describes two stages when training health practitioners. Firstly, developing the practitioners’ sensitivity to the potentiality of past or ongoing trafficking and secondly, acting on this awareness, using “red-flags,” as prompts for further screening questions.

Alpert et al's (2014) development of an identification, assessment, and response guidebook for use in Massachusetts health care settings, similarly advise, as do Crane and Moreno (2011) and Schwarz et al (2016), alertness to “red-flags”. “Red flags” included a person not allowed to speak, an inability or reluctance to communicate living arrangement and circumstances, and any physical indicators of abuse, medical neglect or multiple sexually transmitted diseases. Schwartz et al (2016) argue the necessity for clearly defined stakeholder role definitions and clearly articulated and referencing of organisational policies that may be implicated (e.g. existing mandatory reporting that may be triggered by the abuse of the trafficked person) if treatment is to be successful and move beyond the first identification and treatment stage.

Social workers - contribution to identification and treatment of trafficked persons

Social workers have been singled out as having a critical role and expert skills and knowledge to contribute to the identification, treatment and referral of trafficked persons. Busch-Armendariz, Nsonwu and Heffron (2014) highlighted social workers and their utilization of social work perspectives as providing a strong and effective framework for service delivery and effective interdisciplinary collaboration. Similarly, Davy’s (2016) review of support programs of three U.S.-based human-trafficking victim support program evaluations, identified social work, when using its ecological theory perspective to support trafficked persons, to lead, coordinate and integrate support services, were at the forefront of effective service delivery for human-trafficking victims.

Research gap

This small study, a collaboration between St Vincent’s Health Australia (SVHA) and Australian Religious Against Trafficking of Humans (ACRATH) situated within an Australian hospital, responds to the limited or lack of Australian research into social workers’ identification, treatment, and referral of trafficked persons. Reported is part of phase one of the projects: the scoping of social worker identification of trafficked persons. Phase two, for conclusion in 2019, the design and trail, based on the data gathered in phase one, an education package for health care workers that would inform health workers’ work with trafficked persons.

Methodology and method

A qualitative approach was used as the data gathering method. In response to general flyers advertising the focus groups, eighteen social workers representing 12% of the social workers employed at SVHA and 20% of social workers employed across SVHA Victorian sites, self-selected to attend a forty-five-minute focus group. In response to general flyers advertising the focus groups, eighteen social workers representing 12% of the social workers employed at SVHA and 20% of social workers employed across SVHA Victorian sites, self-selected to attend a forty-five-minute focus group session. During the focus groups participants had an opportunity to explore and interpret their experiences, perceptions of trafficked persons, and their views of the professional skills, trafficking-enslavement-training programs needed to identify, treat, and refer them.

Data was digitally recorded to ensure that specific quotes were retrievable at the data analysis stage. Additionally, an ACRATH note taker was present during each focus groups to document critical feedback. The researcher also added her field notes to the collected data. Focus group transcripts and recordings were analysed thematically using the NVivoTM computer program (QSR International). This involved becoming familiar with the transcripts through careful reading and rereading, coding and recoding units of data,
establishing preliminary themes and settling on subthemes (Spencer, Ritchie, Ormston, O'Connell, & Barnard, 2014).

Findings and discussion
Confirming literature, trafficked and enslaved persons remained invisible to the participants within this project. Their understanding of the terms “trafficked” and “enslaved” were conflated with descriptions, said to be drawn from media representations, restricted to “young women forced to marry old men”, “provide someone to someone else in exchange for money”. Social workers acknowledged their unfamiliarity with the current human trafficking and modern slavery discourses and explained that the issue was beyond their immediate personal or professional experience (feels far away and something that happens overseas”, “wouldn’t consider it often”. “No concept of how many forced marriages, could even hazard a guess”) although were “aware of the issue through reading, news articles”.

Discussing contact with HT or EN persons, seventeen social workers indicated that they “probably” or “quite likely” had come into contact with HT or EN persons but would not be aware of this encounter, however could not confidently claim to have knowingly treated a HT or EN person. On interrogating the “probability” of encountering a HT or EN person, a minority of social workers reflected international findings (Alpert et al., 2014; Crane & Moreno, 2011) that highlight the use of “red flags” as prompts to investigate the possibility of HT or EN (“A woman said she had debts overseas and was working in the field in the sun for long hours with few breaks – she said it was her family but her body language suggested otherwise”, “I had a feeling, I couldn’t put a name to it”).

Similar to other research findings (Davy, 2015; Gibbons & Stoklosa, 2016) the absence of formal education underpinned why HT or EN persons were not identified when presenting at the hospital. Data indicated that, although some were attuned to multiple or interrelated symptoms, none could “join the dots” and pursue suspicions of trafficking. As one social worker stated: “Woman aged 40, debilitated because of speech, she had poor mobility, poor personal care and was very scared and inconsistent with information – the closest I’ve come to thinking somethings not right”. Social workers also indicated that the ability to identify, treat, and refer HT and EN persons also requires organisational capacity building with clear policy and procedures for health practitioners to follow. Their view was that identifying HT or EN persons was not without difficulty for the professional involved. Social worker’s limited opportunity to intervene in the cycle of exploitation and role in elevating the health of trafficked and enslaved person was negatively influenced by the lack of clarity around hospital policy and procedures (”I’m reluctant to ask questions because I don’t know what to do afterwards”, “we don’t have a formal procedure, don’t know what I would do, I’m opening a can of worms”). The absence of clear policies and procedures was seen as further endangering the HT or EN person (don’t want to call the immigration department because it may put eh persons further at risk”). These views and concerns resonate with previous research that concludes the barriers to HT and EN successful negotiation of the health system and to health practitioners’ provision of health services (Dovydaitis, 2010; Yarborough, Jones, Cyr, Phillips, & Stelzner, 2000).

Reaffirming the efficacy of education and training supports, and strategies that build a knowledge and skill base within and across discipline groups (Ahn et
al., 2013; Domoney, 2015) social workers emphasised the program services and education needs to be developed through the HT and EN person's lens rather than the practitioner. This lens was regarded as consistent with the trauma informed lens currently used within the hospital to inform work with other vulnerable groups. The use of a trauma informed lens is noted in current HT and EN research literature (Alpert et al., 2014; Gibbons & Stoklosa, 2016). The ecological perspective, indicated as the social workers’ strong and effective practice framework (Busch-Armendariz et al., 2014; Davy, 2016) was also noted by the participants as the expert skills and knowledge that they could transfer to the identification, treatment and referral of HT and EN persons (we have benefited from family violence training. Existing structures are useful for this as for any other vulnerability”, “We are trained in things to look for in elder abuse, children at risk, family violence”).

Conclusion

This study confirmed the evidence elsewhere stressing the importance of well trained, educated and supported health care workers charged with the care of HT and EN persons. Barriers to the identification and treatment of HT and EN persons were situated in social workers' skills and knowledge gaps as well as in the organisation's lack of clear policy and procedures. These barriers can partly be addressed by educating health professionals in how to identify and treat trafficked persons. Previous studies have documented the positive improvement in treating HT and EN persons when health workers have been trained and policy and procedures are clear and unambiguous (Gibbons & Stoklosa, 2016; Macia-Konstantopoulos, 2016). The social work's unique contribution to the identification, treatment and referral of HT and EN persons can be central to minimising barriers to HT and EN people's engagement with the health system. Social work's simultaneous focus on and attention to both the person and the person's environment. Social workers can respond to the challenges and needs presented by HT and EN survivors and responders. Using their skills and knowledge are able to work with groups, communities, organisations or programs, legal, health, and educational systems and navigate the micro level (the individual and family) and macro level structures to ensure that, as one social worker put it “Modern slavery and trafficking is in our back yard – we need to address it”.

References


This article will examine the phenomenon of labor trafficking in the construction industry and presents a technological solution that is currently being developed to identify vulnerabilities in the construction supply chain. This solution— a Global Subcontractor Registry— has the potential to increase transparency, thereby decreasing trafficking dramatically. The International Labor Organization (ILO) estimates 24.9 million people are exploited through forced labor (ILO, 2017b). Roughly, 7.5 million people are trafficked in the industries of construction, manufacturing, and mining (ILO, 2017b). The entire ecosystem of construction includes a complex supply chain that runs from formal to informal sectors, with informal sectors being the most dangerous for forced labor practices. The primary challenge with supply chain transparency is the inability to get past the first tier due to many factors including the size of most construction subcontractors (less than 20 employees), lags in technology, and management of sub-tiers through payment waivers and not behavior. The Global Subcontractor Registry is a proposed web-based technology that addresses these challenges and provides a mechanism to identify vulnerability points in the supply chain and disrupt the chain of slavery.
Context

In 2013, headlines screamed about the “World Cup Slaves of Qatar.” A Guardian investigation revealed that thousands of laborers from Nepal were being exploited and abused as modern-day slaves building the city for the World Cup in 2022 (Pattisson, 2013). These workers were unable to leave, forced to work in the hot sun without access to water and many hadn’t been paid in months. Over 1,200 workers had died by 2015, and the total death toll is estimated to reach 4,000 by 2022 (International Trade Union Confederation Special Report, 2014). This horrendous story is only one of many.

Though slavery is illegal in nearly every country in the world, it still affects over 40 million people. The International Labour Organization (ILO) estimates 7.5 million people are trafficked in the industries of construction, manufacturing and mining (ILO, 2017b). 1 in 4 of those trafficked are children (ILO, 2017a). Because some countries do not have child labor laws, about 152 million children globally participate in child labor (ILO, 2017a). With the growth of the global economy resulting in a development boom, transnational labor becomes a necessity and the commodification of human beings has exploded.

Traffickers make an incredible profit of 150 billion dollars a year so any move to fight trafficking is met by intense resistance (ILO, 2017b). Threats, coercion and murder are not out of the ordinary. In order to combat human trafficking and forced labor in the construction industry, systems of change are dependent on multi-disciplinary collaboration from various stakeholder sectors that are impacted by the problem. This solution- a Global Subcontractor Registry has the potential to increase transparency, thereby decreasing trafficking dramatically.

Overview of Labor Trafficking

Sex trafficking, which affects an estimated 4.8 million people around the world- 99% of whom are women, has garnered most of the public and private attention of the human trafficking space (ILO, 2017b). This is true even though all international reports have indicated that Labor is the primary form or trafficking (DOS, 2018). Six indicators of forced labor and enslavement include (ILO, 2017b):

1. Threats or actual physical harm to the worker
2. Restriction of movement and confinement (to the workplace or other limited area)
3. Debt bondage: workers have to pay off debt or loan, is not paid for his/her services. These debts, including shelter or accommodations are at such inflated prices that the worker cannot escape the debt
4. Withholding of wages or excessive wage reductions (violation of previously made agreements)
5. Retention of passports or other identity documents so that workers cannot leave, prove their identity, or their status (or the lack of status)
6. Threat of denunciation to the authorities, usually where the worker has an irregular immigration status

All of these indicators are present in some way, shape or form whether the trafficking is domestic or occurs across borders. Verité, a non-profit organization monitoring supply chains discovered that risk factors of trafficking included: low skilled labor in the “three d’s” (dirty, dangerous, and/or difficult work), seasonal or short lifecycles, competitive industries with low barriers to entry, offshore manufacturing, reliance on labor recruiting and non-transparent supply chains (Verité, 2015).

Coercion is often the mitigating factor in deciding whether a situation should be considered “trafficking” or “modern day slavery.” However, it is now accepted that coercion may take any number of forms from psychological pressure to debt bondage to physical threats or harm (Skrivankova, 2010). Since coercion and denial of freedom could be extremely subtle such as veiled threats, it is sometimes difficult to ascertain that trafficking is occurring. For example, some migrants may believe or actually possessed legal means of entering and working in a country, but they will get their papers and passports taken away or be forced to “overstay their visas.” In these cases, the ability to report their exploitation is hindered by the possible feeling either that they will be turned into the authorities and arrested or that their conditions are temporary and therefore, able to be tolerated (Owens et al, 2014).

Another aspect to consider is within industries that are mostly male, and migrants are from patriarchal countries, there is an element of shame in telling the truth about the situation or ending up in such a situation to begin with. They may believe that they could or should have somehow avoided being exploited, trafficked or enslaved. In these cases, it may be that silence is caused by not wanting to admit weakness or that they are in need of help (Kimmel, 2004).

Free trade agreements in the 1990’s heralded an era of globalization that decentralized and privatized industry, creating what some critics called a “race to the bottom” (McGrath and Mieres, 2017, p.8). While this was perhaps an overstatement, what remained true was that putting the fate of labor in the hands of private companies created a world where higher profits were literally made on the backs of cheap labor. This gave rise to contractualized labor, feminization of labor, reliance on subcontractors and working conditions that adhered to two different sets of rules- those inside and outside of zones (Arnold and Pickles, 2011). These practices, hallmarks of globalization, contributed greatly to the vulnerability of a global work force.

Subcontractualization in particular, helps to exacerbate the problem of exploited labor and the even more serious occurance of trafficked labor. Hess (2004) points out that the need for subcontractors adds to the already growing “fragmentation and dispersion of production” (McGrath and Mieres, 2017, p. 7). Thus, the political, socioeconomic and geographical contexts of supply chains may become confused in its journey. The confusion adds to the complexity and may aid in hiding labor trafficking. Intermediaries such as recruiters, those providing ancillary services like transportation or accommodation and even lower level subcontractors can be sites that are not accounted for.
The Importance of Supply Chain

Within the last ten years, supply chain dynamics have been considered as a possible site where interventions may be directed. The intersection of trafficking and supply chain makes sense because it’s the nexus of stakeholders in the continuum from owners to consumers; government agencies, and labor. Parella (2014) also believes it solves the problem of the transnational nature of trafficking because supply chains cover the entire workflow. This allows for leverage over bad actors, especially in instances where target actors are several steps (and countries) removed (Parella, 2014). Supply chains provide insight to modern day slavery and vulnerability to trafficking and exploitative labor practices.

There is growing international legislation supporting supply chain transparency. The UK Modern Slavery Act of 2015 (Act, 2015). Section 54, a provision in the law is the Transparency in Supply Chains. Section 54 requires that any commercial organization, in any sector that supplies goods or services and carries out even part of their business in the UK and has annual (gross) receipts of $56 million dollars must produce a statement about their supply chain (Act, 2015). The California Transparency in Supply Chains (CA-TISC) law passed in 2012. This is the only US law that targets supply chain transparency. CA-TISC only requires retail sellers and manufacturers doing business in the state with more than $100 million (gross) annually to disclose what they are doing to eradicate slavery in their direct supply chain as well as to disclose their supply chain (Enrile, 2017). There has been movement to rank or rate companies, but no public listing of this. Companies struggle to comply with the law, with only an average of a 60% success rate (Watch & Winsor, 2015).

Next iterations of legislation should include requirements that address, intervene or prevent labor trafficking. Until then, initiatives and innovations must be developed for transparency. The trajectory of global legislation indicates that it is only a matter of time before transparency becomes mandatory and sought after as a symbol of good business practices as savvy customers will demand such disclosures (Enrile and Ritchie, 2017).

The Construction Industry and Labor Trafficking

Construction developed from just building to provide basic needs of shelter, distance (transportation), and public spaces, to more diverse and complex projects that are more technical and sophisticated (Oyewobi, Oke, Ganiyu, Shittu, Isa, & Nwokobia, 2011). The construction sector is one of the largest drivers of development worldwide, and one of the largest employers. In some regions, such as the Middle East, construction comprises nearly a quarter of cities’ domestic product (Buckley, 2012). The Global South houses roughly 70% of the total estimated 115 million construction workers (Chang, 2008).

Previous research reveals exploitation and forced labor in the construction industry (Wilkinson, Craig, & Gaus, 2010). The main factors leading to human trafficking include: intensification of work (speed and the need for profit); high concentrations of migrant labor; and the heavy reliance on subcontractors and agency (recruitment) labor (Lalani and Metcalf, 2012). The construction industry is known for its short term contracts, subcontractor based supply chains and informal employment practices (Lingard, Cooke, & Blismas, 2009). It should not be surprising then, that the level of vulnerability is extremely high. With the world poised to develop rapidly over the next decade, the construction industry is estimated to become a ten trillion-dollar business (Enrile & Ritchie, 2018b; Lucintel, 2017).

The isolation of this workforce is a key feature in its vulnerability. Workers are segregated and isolated into company barracks or even subdivisions outside of the cities they were building (Ahmed, 2007). This invisibility created distance and space from the more affluent and it also discouraged workers from fully integrating in society (Elsheshawy, 2008). Project based construction makes this look efficient and is not questioned. There is a fine line between housing and captivity.

Subcontractualization and agency labor is predominately used to cut labor costs, especially in industries where there are fluctuations in demand. In light of these types of fluctuations, seasonal or contract work is called for and composes a majority of construction labor since jobs are often segmented and completed through phases. Because labor costs are one of the largest drains on resources, the economic argument is compelling enough to utilize more than three tiers of subcontractualization in the supply chain. Workers, who are usually recruited by agencies are subject to huge forms of debt before they even leave their countries, resulting in debt bondage (Jordan, 2011). The maintenance of risk, vulnerability and actual instances of debt bondage or enslavement is enforced by a number of variables including coercion and forced removal of documentation.

Fighting Trafficking in the Construction Industry through Supply Chain Transparency

There is very little known about the concrete conditions of workers throughout the construction supply chain. The number of subcontractors in a construction project can sometimes go over five layers deep (Radovich, personal communication, July 23, 2015). The culture of construction itself plays a part in the lack of knowledge since, in many countries, the United States included, construction remains a very private industry, based on informal systems. One also cannot ignore prior (and perhaps continuing) engagement of criminal elements within this industry such as the mafia and other organized crime (Shelley, 1995). Another thing to consider is that at each point in the supply chain, these factors may change. In a review of supply chain initiatives aimed at addressing trafficking and forced labor, DemandAT and researchers McGrath and Mieres (2017) found that initiatives were found in the following realms: policy and legislation; CSR initiatives; and collective labor bargaining agreements. Policy and legislation, has focused on reducing victimization of migrant workers. However, the
trajectory of legislation focusing on transparency is progressing. Ormond of ASSET, an organization who influenced CA-TISC believes this is the first step in knowing where to intervene, that knowing supply chain is necessary (Ormond, personal communication, August 1, 2018). Allain et al. (2013) believes this legislation is good because it raises awareness of the issue. The challenge remains of how to reach deeper in to the chain. The next step in legislation is to provide “teeth” by creating enforceable guidelines when companies find trafficking in their supply chains. Unfortunately, without regulatory compliances, businesses are loathe to do anything that will cut into their bottom line. A final note to consider is the transnational nature of trafficking which necessitates laws that operate beyond borders. Currently, there are no laws or regulations save for trade agreements which have disadvantaged workers. International agreements must be created with the goal of reducing trafficking and forced labor.

CSR (Corporate Social Responsibility) initiatives are another area focused on supply chain. Mostly, CSR initiatives must be considered voluntary measures because companies are exerting their own efforts and their own resources. These initiatives have been noted primarily in the garment industry where unions and the public have influenced (if not forced) companies to take a stance against sweatshop labor (Anner, M., Bair, J. & Blasi, J., 2013). In 2012, Global Business Coalition Against Human Trafficking (gBCAT) was formed. This coalition was composed of a number of multi-national businesses and their aim was provide training to their employees about trafficking in general and provide financial support to organizations working on the issue (Linnhoff, S., Martin, H., Smith, K., & Smith, M., 2014). While this tends to be the bulk of CSR activities, companies are moving towards more proactive CSR aimed at their supply chain. For example, Ford Motor Company’s CSR includes incorporating independent audits to help improve its supply chain. These audits are made public and employees are encouraged to provide their own insights and recommendations (Crump, 2016).

Where initiatives are focused on supply chain, various methodologies are used that cut across all three areas. These include legal instruments (not just policy, but also laws and regulations); supply chain monitoring (SCM); employer guidance; recruitment; consumer information/awareness; boycotts; institutional procurement; disclosure mandates; financial support from public bodies (with the idea that such funding would be revoked if supply chains proved to be compromised); alternative business models such as fair trade; investor/shareholder actions; trade related agreements (for instance, banning products made from compromised supply chains); and worker organizing (focus is on collective bargaining). Along with innovative approaches and collaborative systems of change, the possibilities of how to affect change lead to unconventional and perhaps formerly unexplored perspectives.

**Construction Technology as a Solution**

The technological aspect of construction is more or less confined to either work site building and safety or project management. The former is composed of drones, wearables, mobile devices and artificial intelligence helping workers maintain a safe work environment or assisting them with the actual build of the project. The latter may be composed of something as simple as Excel spreadsheets or with an entire enterprise solution. Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) software is the most comprehensive option for project management because the data is real-time and
complete. This type of platform is prudent for modern construction and development projects because these projects entail a number of collaborators from general contractors, subcontractors, architects and owners (to name a few) within shared activities from job sites, remote locations and offices (Čuš-Babič, N., Rebolj, D., Nekrep-Perc, M., & Podbreznik, P., 2014). High levels of interoperability is required to manage communication within the project lifecycle (Jardim-Goncalves, R., Popplewell, K., & Grilo, A., 2012). The growing adoption and implementation of ERP software makes this a platform to build upon in order to increase transparency within the supply chain. Construction supply chains are intricate- sometimes composed of tens of hundreds of companies, components and services (Cheng, Law, Bjornsson, Jones, & Sriram, 2010). ERP software may offer the potential to shed light on key business relationships and workflows relevant to seeing more than bottlenecks in the process, but also highlighting the gaps in the process that leave workers vulnerable (Cheng et al., 2010). For an additional layer of understanding, the project life cycle in construction runs parallel to supply chains, making it a strong tool to determine where the best opportunity for intervention may be (Cheng et al, 2010).

Leaders in construction-based ERP software asserts that pre-qualification and certification information within global databases will be more effective than traditional audits in encouraging transparency because it will not require more of project stakeholders included owners than what they are already doing. Constant monitoring of all parties involved in the construction process using compliances can be done by the software to identify the troubling metrics that a human would need to investigate. The combination of technology and human oversight would allow construction managers and owners to address any possible criminal activity in real-time. Currently, most public construction projects (cities, states, countries, etc.), pay out their general contractors and subcontractors and if any misconduct is identified, they investigate post-payment (Jacinto, personal communication, 2018). The function of payment deferral allows project managers and inspectors to investigate prior to payment and resolve matters, saving public entities thousands of dollars. This would also modify behaviors to eliminate bad actors in the space and allow for prevention instead of correction.

Global Subcontractor Registry

The need to be able to provide accurate data for human trafficking is reliability collected through methodologically sound means (Robinson, Branchini & Thame, 2017). Registries have been used by law enforcement in sex trafficking cases and have shown to reduce recidivism (Brown, 2011). Registries have not been used in labor trafficking, although there has been a move to improve data collection practices. The City Bar Justice Center reported a dearth of knowledge in labor trafficking and recommended the creation of registries in every state in the US based on current agreed upon definitions and supported by legislation (Tomatore & Matthews-Jolly, 2013). Though a step in the right direction, there are limitations to such a registry because it would be dependent on legislation, must come from and be monitored by law enforcement and carries with it the stigma of prosecution. It is also crucial to have a proactive approach with a database that allows prevention of corrupt activities.

The ecosystem of construction includes a complex supply chain that runs from formal to informal sectors, with informal sectors being the most dangerous for forced labor practices. The primary challenge with supply chain transparency is the inability to get past the first tier and get into both formal and informal sectors as Crane, LeBaron, Allain, & Behbahani (2017) have identified. The difficulty of doing this may be due to many things such as the fact that most construction subcontractors are small companies of less the 20 employees, construction lags in technology to other industries, and prime contractors manage sub-tiers through payment waivers and not behavior, and the nature of payrolls prohibits payments being released – so most employers need to create special reports that redact employee information something that is cost prohibitive.

The Global Subcontractor Registry is a website that stores their tax-id verified collaborators in the project (who will be referred to as Business Partners). Tying company identities to their business proves legitimacy as those companies without proper credentials will not even be able to complete step one. General contractors who are in charge of the project will register the project specifics, their information and that of all their subcontractors. This is powerful because it sets the baseline for what contractors will be accountable for. Also, knowing the scope of the project will help determine if the workers listed are appropriate. For instance, if a project requires 100 workers and only 20 are listed, this would be a red flag. All parties involved in a project would be mandated to enter their information into the registry for each of their employees, including a pre-qualification questionnaire that includes information on labor practices that will be used to shed light on possible instances of trafficking or forced labor. These items have been identified in partnership with UNSEEN-UK. They include:

- Name and location of recruitment agency
- Geographical location that they originate from
- Basic demographic information
- Job description

These are somewhat simple items that may be collected anyway. Any certifications or documentation needed to be considered to work will also be requested. This is the first step towards payment transparency within the construction space. It ensures that subcontractors are being paid on time, and conversely, that work being done is completed and compliant. In terms of convenience, users will only have to enter this information once. The software would maintain records and automated features would make it simple for collaborators to enter information
and not have to revisit or think about it again.

A key aspect of the registry will be the ability to provide ratings for each subcontractor when issuing work. Ratings will be weighted according to proximity of relationship with the subcontractor. Ideally, these ratings will be able to reveal good actors in the space. Currently, only the UK provides ratings for businesses and their supply chain transparency (Act, 2015). Perhaps, a later iteration of this registry will be able to include such ratings in addition to ratings that may be developed through further data analytics derived from their registry.

The subcontractor registry will allow owners to better select their prime and specialty contractors, while systemically monitoring their adherence to labor compliances throughout the entire project lifecycle by review them with each payment and before release retainage.

Three major cities in North America, the Middle East, and Southeast Asia will be the first to test the Global Subcontractor Registry. In addition to universal aspects of the registry (such as the trafficking portion of the questionnaire), cities may set up, sign and update compliances within the registry. As assumed by its name- the goal of the Global Subcontractor Registry is to create a global index of subcontractors. The registry will provide information such as ratings, compliances and quality of work, which will naturally reveal a hierarchy of subcontractors. Once enough information is collected, the Global Subcontractor Registry will be able to function as a central platform where project managers may find resources that are rated high for their work, meeting compliances and transparency. The registry will operationalize all rating schemes to fit into this framework so that it is something that developers may include in their practice.

Conclusion

The Global Subcontractor Registry operates on the premise of collaboration with corporations, something rarely practiced in anti-trafficking efforts. It does this by emphasizing the role that construction companies can play in the increase of transparency- instead of asking them to “fix” a trafficking problem. Many companies do not want to admit to trafficking and modern day slavery even if they are aware of it. For some, they feel it will impact their bottom line and for others- they just don’t know enough to feel confident that they can do anything. This is why being able to create a solution like the Global Subcontractor Registry that is part of ERP platforms that companies are already using and familiar with will increase the probability of use and participation. Technologies such as Building Information Modeling (BIM) and blockchain may be used to disrupt trafficking in the construction industry. For instance, BIM modeling is currently being used in many construction projects and it bridges any information gaps and provide context for construction projects in several dimensions from model to cost (Čuš-Babič, N., Rebolj, D., Nekrep-Perc, M., & Podbreznik, P., 2014). Also, Blockchain is currently being used to verify or safekeep identities and track the supply chain within programs such as Providence, ConsenSys and more (Capri, 2018; United Nations, 2018; Sundararajan, 2017). While this has not yet fully been adopted by construction, it is only a matter of time that it will be incorporated to various portions of the supply chain and overall life cycle.

Trafficking and modern day slavery is an epidemic affecting millions of people. Around the world. The traditional interventions of policy change (ie: more legislation enacted), practice interventions and even research are not moving fast enough to disrupt and end trafficking. It is imperative to have new partners and innovation in spaces that are out of the ordinary and able to address the needs of all stakeholders in collaborations that will instigate widespread transformation

Editor’s note

As there are too many references to include in this edition I suggest you contact authors for a full list

Annalisa Enrile enrile@usc.edu

Oliver Ritchie oliverr@rogers.com
Social norms and child trafficking:
A springboard for social workers to facilitate community-based child protection interventions

Violence against children is a threat and it poses major challenges to the advancement of children’s wellbeing and their development. Social norms-facilitated trafficking is a child rights violation that goes beyond cultural and socio-economic positions. According to the United Nations (UN) Trafficking Protocol (2000), child trafficking is the recruitment, transportation, and receipt of children for exploitation (e.g. sexual, labour, domestic work, illegal abortion, marriage, farm work, begging). It is a spatially complex phenomenon embedded in socio-cultural relations with varied manifestations. The Protocol also highlights that a child cannot give valid consent in any exploitation-related situation. Descriptive or injunctive social norms which might influence child trafficking are collective views “about others that exist within social groups and are maintained through group approval and disapproval” (Lilleston et al., 2017, p. 123). Although social norms do not always reflect reality, they can influence perceived trafficking-related behaviour, values and attitudes, and beliefs. Previous studies have highlighted links between social norms and child trafficking, although there is still a dearth of information (Msuya, 2017), especially from a social work perspective. Thus, social work, as a professional discipline, needs to critically reflect on, and engage with the nexus between social norms and child trafficking thoroughly.

This article links harmful social norms and child trafficking. It further builds on analysis of abuse of African tradition and culture (e.g. by Msuya, 2017) as an underlying root cause of child trafficking and violence against children. In addition, it contributes to on-going conversations, debates and reflections on norms and child protection. It does not claim to be an exhaustive review of evidence, and although the methodology is based on desktop reviews, it was not systematic in nature. This article is also not an attempt to silence perspectives of girls or community members or to excuse perpetrators. We provide a brief overview of the legal framework and practical and theoretical ties concerning social norms and child trafficking. It also highlights rights violations and stresses that intervention programmes must be accountable and responsive to the specific community’s needs, wisdom and assets.

Brief overview of legal instruments

International legal conventions have been adopted to combat trafficking. For example, the Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) calls for the rejection of customary practices that support stereotyped and role differentiation, and the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) also guarantees children’s rights and protection from violence. According to the UNCRC, the following children’s rights are violated during trafficking: right to life, survival and development, protection, participation and information. The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) Target 5.3 (i.e. eliminate all harmful practices) and Target 16.2 (i.e. end abuse, exploitation, trafficking and all forms of violence against and torture of children) support combating trafficking and harmful practices that impact children. Select regional and sub-regional instruments that provide provisions for addressing child trafficking include the African Charter on the Right and Welfare of the Child (ACRWC), Maputo Protocol, Ouagadougou Action Plan and the Southern Africa Development Community (SADC) Regional Plan of Action on Trafficking in Persons (Warria, 2013). These legal instruments call for rights-based approaches which require developing interventions from a rights perspective to ensure that the rights of trafficked children and those vulnerable to trafficking are fulfilled.

Different African countries have dual legal systems which acknowledge both statutory and customary laws. These norms do not exist in a vacuum but within dual legal systems, and are shaped by greater ecological forces such as policy, culture or religion. According to Msuya (2017, p. 3), culture is a social
construct and therefore “it does not exist independently of the people who construct it.” Norms which do not confer status on women and girls and support gender discrimination and inequalities impact children’s rights and well-being. Practitioners and community members should examine if, how and when traditional practices impact children’s rights. Indeed, the gauge for valuation of cultural practices should be rights-based (Martin & Mbambo, 2011).

**Child trafficking, social norms and the socio-ecological model**

Social work supports the person-in-environment framework and acknowledges that the environment is critical to a person’s existence, functioning and survival. Regardless of the type of exploitation experienced by children who are trafficked, violence related to child trafficking is a social challenge that is embedded within the broader social ecology (Lillston et al., 2017). Thus, the socio-ecological model provides a framework for understanding how a child’s development and wellbeing is nested within multiple levels - i.e. individual, inter-personal, family, community and societal. Compliance with social norms can ensure an individual’s (or their family’s) survival, success and progress (Msuya, 2017). According to Lillston et al., (2017, p. 123), social norms are an essential element within this ecology and they can prevent, reduce or perpetuate child trafficking. This fits in with the notion that influences and shifts at any level and any time can lead to an increase or decrease in victimization or perpetration (Lyles, Cohen & Brown, 2009).

This article calls for a shift from individuals to environments as environmental mechanisms influence individual behavioural outcomes. The cultural complexities associated with child trafficking call for the development of socially innovative interventions tailored to encourage ideological shifts and to embrace and promote ethically acceptable and protective norms. This is because in ecological-based interventions power inequities and imbalances can be negotiated, the spirit of listening created, and informal social networks endorsed. Community-based and led approaches are a crucial step towards the implementation of transformational processes which support sustainability and the SDG’s (Wessells, 2018). There is need to think out of the box and to have interventions that not only address signs and symptoms but also tackle social rights and the deeply engrained root causes and systems. Indeed, failure to detect, acknowledge and address the underlying causes emanating from socio-cultural complexities undermine the process of fighting child trafficking.

Norms which overlook childhood violence may be publicly or tacitly shared by professionals tasked to assist victims and protect children. This element of cultural acceptability does not diminish the effect for the child victims. Furthermore, social workers should guard against their attitudes and perceptions as what they might think is (dys)functional (re)produces normative discourses which subsequently influence client systems and can become set social constructions in communities (Hochfeld, 2008, p. 95).

The damaging norms that contribute to trafficking can be categorized as:

- Traditional male roles and patriarchal attitudes and values which promote domination, objectification,
control, oppression, and dangerous risk-taking behaviours. Dominant male figures are viewed as the embodiment of inheritance, entitlement and power, which subsequently victimizes and devalues girls and their roles. For example, in Niger, wahaya ("fifth wife") is the unofficial wife but actually exploited domestically by the other four wives and sexually by her husband (and their female children subsequently sold as wahaya by the husband) (Msuya, 2017). As it is a sign of wealth and prestige, men can have more than one wahaya.

The African saying "bringing up a girl is like watering the neighbour’s garden" implies that investments in girls are for the benefit of others. The preferential treatment of boys disadvantages girls, denies them opportunities for advancement and makes them vulnerable to trafficking.

• Limited female/gender roles based on restricted female socialization. From an early age girls are encouraged overtly and subtly to act in ways that cause them to be objectified, submissive and controlled by others. Contradictions exist in the strict regulation of girls’ sexual lives, on the one hand, while on the other, their childhood is often (hyper-)sexualized, which leads to a blurring of consent and age of consent. Family honour and a socio-cultural preference for child brides feed trafficking for marriage (Warria, 2017). Cultural practices such as trokosi ("slave to the gods") in West Africa devalues and enslaves girls. The tradition forces families to give up virgin girls (usually 6-15 years old) to live under exploitative conditions in traditional shrines, satisfying the priests’ sexual desires and working on their farms for their lifetime (Msuya, 2017).

• Norms related to power encourage claiming and maintaining control over others. In many African societies the saying “children should be seen and not heard” makes them vulnerable to being trafficked, especially by adults. Parents have ownership of their children, and children are dependent on adults and are expected to obey adults unquestioningly. Often, there is cultural pressure to respect elders’ wishes irrespective of what they are. Child trafficking for labour relates to customary attitudes towards children’s “powerless-powerful” role in family -i.e. participation in work. The impact of child labour on academic outcomes makes children vulnerable to exploitation. Children are also vulnerable to sexual exploitation because they have less power (especially girls, who are positioned at the bottom of the gender hierarchy). In South Africa, the practice of ukuthwala ("forced marriage") is similar to that in Tanzania, where girls are abducted by their suitors, forced to have sex with them then a marriage negotiated thereafter. Due to the rape, the girl fears stigmatization, and to maintain family honour the family accepts the bride price and the girl marries the abductor. Forced child marriage is a rights violation and a form of trafficking (Warria, 2017).

• Norms related to violence whereby violence is accepted as part of normal behaviour and applied to resolve problems. The link to trafficking lies in the

ImPLICATIONS FOR A SOCIAL WORK COMMUNITY-BASED CHILD PROTECTION INTERVENTION

When African cultural practices are romanticized, this leads to a powerful disservice to African women and girls through their exclusion from sites and positions of power (Hochfeld, 2008). Community-based interventions are not one-size-fits all and they cannot be governed by a set of guidelines, checklist or set of steps to be followed. It is vital for practitioners to build on community assets and start where the communities are i.e. “bottom up” community child protection interventions. Interventions should be grounded in community needs, resilience, power and assets by tapping into local wisdom(s) and local priorities and be carefully linked to collective action. The social worker as the facilitator (not an expert) is there to learn, ask questions, invite dialogue, support conditions conducing to full participation, discuss different options, decisions and actions - i.e. accompanying or walking with the community, not guiding it (Wessells, 2018, p. 33).
According to Msuya (2017, p. 29), “culture is value-driven and helps to maintain values, structure, and unity within a society, but it can never and should never supersede the law or a person’s humanity and individual autonomy ... or be used as an excuse to violate a person’s alienable human rights.” If a positive practice shifts to harm children, there is need for dialogue to start understanding the shifting function of the specific norm and the (emerging) needs of that community regarding the practice. This calls for a humble orientation while one elicits inclusive dialogue and deeper listening, and provides psychosocial and cultural spaces conducive to engagement, mobilization and collective decision-making. Harnessing people’s power is in line with Paulo Freire’s writing, which emphasizes dignity, agency and voice, which in turn leads to the establishment of meaningful, long-term, trust-based, reciprocal relationships which nurture organic change.

Based on the schema change approach and informed by the diffusion of innovations theory, the delivery of counter evidence on norms and child trafficking, e.g. through influential leaders, can change socially shared beliefs and thus shift people’s perceptions through the introduction of new ideas and presentation of alternative norms (Lilleston et al., 2017, p. 126). Children themselves can also be key influencers of social norms through social networks and social media and in a way they will be incorporating aspects of bystander interventions.

The nudge theory advocates making insignificant changes within an environment which then push community members towards more preferred behaviours without restricting their choices (Lilleston et al., 2017, p. 128). For example, trained community workers and social workers genuinely engage with families to understand their situation and address at-risk factors and reduce household poverty which in turn changes views about trafficking girls.

Customary laws and practices have fundamental child protection aspects as well and are protective of children (Martin & Mbambo, 2011; Msuya, 2017). The positive customary practices, values and norms that promote children’s rights, care and protection should be preserved, encouraged and promoted. In a way, the practitioner will be encouraging the mobilization of community values by including existing core (positive) values already being shared in the community.

Social work interventions should consider the importance of socio-cultural, economic and political contexts (Warria, 2013). Furthermore, there is a need to recognize the political will and also the relationship between differing cultural root values and underlying social norms e.g. honour, bad luck/omens, kinship ties, social positioning in the community and the benefits gained. Narrative methods can assist with capturing local idioms and meanings as the value of language and community members as narrators and meaning-makers is acknowledged (Wessells, 2018). Their stories provide rich information about values, challenges and uncertainties, opinions, and understanding of their social world, socio-cultural rights and positioning. Through the use of probing and follow-up discussions, further clarification of concepts is reached, rich insights are realized and a common understanding is achieved.

According to Hochfeld (2008, p. 102), social workers should constantly reflexively negotiate their own ideals, their clients’ authentic experiences and expectations, cultural imperatives and the actual contexts and question how their own cultural experiences impact service delivery. Ultimately, social workers should work with clients collaboratively in the (re-)constructions of meanings associated with social norms and practices and trafficking vulnerability. Wessells (2018) supports this reflexive, self-critical approach to internalizing sustainable shifts.

Conclusion

Childhood violence remains a threat to children’s wellbeing and rights. Social norms are drivers and maintainers of child trafficking and they should form a core part of any intervention. Norms vary according to context, and thus communities require spaces where they can develop their own ways of working and interventions that fit their contexts, and this short discussion provided suggestions towards this.

There are more issues and questions on social norms and child trafficking that need additional investigation, and this discussion dealt with only some of the important debates. The nexus between social norms and children’s rights is filled with tension and resistance, but there are some strides that can be made. What is also certain is that social workers can protect children in communities where social norms and practices are tolerated, deeply entrenched and practised.

References

Hochfeld, T. (2008). Influencing ... it is our role, it is our duty: How social workers unintentionally reinforce conservative ideas on the family. Agenda, 76, 92-104.


The United Nations Office on Drug and Crime Prevention (2016) defined sexual exploitation as “any actual or attempted abuse of a position of vulnerability, differential power, or trust, for sexual purposes, including, but not limited to, profiting monetarily, socially or politically from the sexual exploitation of another”. The My Life My Choice curriculum (MLMC) is a US based acclaimed 10-session curriculum that provides concrete, well-researched methods for reaching vulnerable adolescent girls (Justice Resource Institute, 2015). In this study, the MLMC curriculum was implemented in rural area to determine its potential for success within the rural setting. This study analyzed the pre- and post-test results of the participants to find if the participants learned from the curriculum. One major limitation from the curriculum was the use of an urban setting for the curriculum that was not realistic for rural youth. Professionals utilizing prevention interventions must remember person in the environment (P.I.E.). And, adapt curriculum to the target population or in this case reflect trafficking in rural settings.
The purpose of this analysis of an exploitation prevention program in rural Minnesota is to determine if the My Life My Choice (MLMC) curriculum provided to girls who reside in Southwest and South Central rural Minnesota educated them about community resources and skills to prevent sexual exploitation. The MLMC curriculum is a proactive program designed to reduce sexual exploitation of girls (Justice Resource Institute, 2015). The MLMC curriculum participants were taught recruitment tactics, primary and secondary prevention resources, and the location of support systems to help a victim leave the commercial sex industry (Justice Resource Institute, 2015).

Previous research (Schauer & Weaton, 2006; Perkins & Ruiz, 2016; Cole & Sprang, 2014) has shown that sex trafficking and exploitation exist in both urban and rural parts of the United States. Minnesota is no exception to this problem as exploitation has been found throughout the state. Previous research (Barnitz, 2001; Rafferty, 2013; Karaz, 2016) has also found those most vulnerable are youth who are homeless, in out of home placement, or come from abusive situations.

This analysis of the pre-and post-test of the MLMC curriculum was to find if the participants of MLMC groups learned about recruitment tactics, primary and secondary prevention resources, and support systems to avoid being sexually exploited or to leave an exploitation situation. The authors hypothesized there will be little difference between how rural youth and urban youth experiencing sexual exploitation and learning through the curriculum. The urban information came from the Chin (2014) research while this is the first research conducted for the MLMC curriculum in a rural setting.

The study of the MLMC curriculum in rural Minnesota found participants gained knowledge about trafficking and exploitation as well as resources in their community to help victims of exploitation. In the story that is part of the curriculum, participants could identify that the victim in the story was exploited, that the “boyfriend” in the story was really a pimp, and that the pimp was going to exploit the victim from their initial meeting. These items all show statistically significant changes between the pre- and post-tests of the participants. One of the major limitations found in this study was the story that is used in the curriculum. The story was based in an urban area and had an urban focus to the trafficking. However, as found by Cole and Sprang (2014) and Perkins and Ruiz (2016), rural sexual exploitation looks different from urban sexual exploitation.

The social service agency (SSA) staff person who implements the MLMC curriculum covers the following counties in Southwest and South Central Minnesota: Blue Earth, Brown, Cottonwood, Faribault, Jackson, Le Sueur, Lincoln, Lyon, Martin, Murray, Nicollet, Nobles, Pipestone, Redwood, Rock, Sibley and Watonwan. The MLMC curriculum was offered to school districts within these counties. The staff person implemented a pre-and post-test to the participants of the MLMC educational groups ensured the researchers that state and federal regulations regarding data collection with vulnerable populations were followed. The staff coded the pre-and post-test surveys. The codes consisted of a specific numeric code for each participant and school district. The participants' ages ranged from 14 to 19 years old.

This analysis of the pre-and post-test provides the SSA with the knowledge of whether the participants of the educational groups learned about recruitment tactics, prevention resources, and support systems to leave the commercial sex industry. The participants completed the curriculum and completed the post-test to verify material learned. The pre- and post-test were developed by the Justice Resource Institute (2015), which owns the MLMC curriculum and provides the training to professionals who use the curriculum on a local level. The pre- and post-test provided participants opportunities for both qualitative and quantitative responses about their learning in the program.

This research study had a purposeful sampling of girls age 14-19 years old who were in high school in Southwest and Southern Minnesota. The participants had been categorized at “at-risk” by their schools. The researchers did not have access to how students were selected to participate in the groups, nor where the researchers made aware of how individual schools identified the “at-risk” girls for participation. The gender identity, racial demographic and specific school of the participants was not given to the researchers and/or not collected in the survey.

The MLMC curriculum has been shown to help youth understand the risks and tactics used by those involved in trafficking. The research conducted for this study confirms that the participants had an increase in knowledge regarding their ability to identify the pimp and in the timing of when the pimp planned to exploit the victim. The participants also showed an increase in their knowledge of resources available within the participants’ communities.

The quantitative findings demonstrate clear differences between Chin's (2014) research and this study. Chin (2014) demonstrated McNemar statistical significance in participant's personal exposure factors, knowledge of recruitment tactics factors, selling sex attitudes factors, and knowledge of community resources. The rural data does not show a personal exposure to exploitation as reflected in the MLMC story. The differences between these studies show a need for discussions on the distinctions between rural and urban sexual exploitation clarifying the differences between urban and rural sexual exploitation. The differences also show the need for social workers to use a person-in-environment (P.I.E.) approach when working with victims of exploitation to understand how exploitation presents differently in different parts of the country.

One of the primary distinctions was the geographical location of the participants. Chin's (2014) study occurred in a New Jersey metropolitan area and the participants of this study reside in a rural area. According to Cole and Sprang (2014) and Perkins and
Ruiz (2016) people in rural areas who commercially exploit children are often known to the victim. Cole and Sprang (2014) and Perkins and Ruiz (2016) noted that people who commercially exploit children in rural areas often receive material goods rather than money for sex with children. The researchers of this study affirmed statements by Cole and Sprang (2014) and Perkins and Ruiz (2026) that rural exploitation is not for monetary gain, rather for material goods or basic needs; for example, a parental figure selling a child for food or shelter. It must be acknowledged that there is extremely little literature that identifies the rural versus the metropolitan commercial exploiter. Cole and Sprang (2014) found that rural sexual exploitation might be different from exploitation that occurs in metropolitan regions; they also found that most often the perpetrator of the exploitation (pimp) was a family member, which seems to imply that prevention materials need to reflect this information. The Cole and Sprang (2014) finding of the perpetrator most often being a family member is not the story (Anna and Junior) used in the MLMC curriculum. This research set out to verify that participants of the MLMC curriculum learn about recruitment tactics, primary and secondary prevention resources, and support systems to avoid being sexually exploited or to leave an exploitation situation. Though the qualitative and quantitative data from the research, this was achieved. The authors also believed there would be little difference between rural and urban participants of the MLMC curriculum. This, however, is where the data diverged. This research shows the need for more focus on rural sexual exploitation when conducting the curriculum as well as further research on rural sexual exploitation in general. The lack of connection between the Chin (2014) research and this research shows that developing a rural aspect to the curriculum would be beneficial to participants. One major limitation from the curriculum was the use of an urban setting for the curriculum that was not realistic for rural youth. Professionals utilizing prevention interventions must remember P.I.E. And, adapt curriculum to the target population or in this case reflect trafficking in rural settings.

References


But even in the face of transnational agreements, and a country’s recognition of the need for collaboration across international borders, local responses are emerging to address the negative consequences of trafficking. The authors have examined these responses closely at the border of the United States and Mexico. Through multiple web-based reviews of organizational responses, they came to appreciate the multiplicity of organizational forms that have emerged on the border. Not only do those forms reflect the diversity of responses to human trafficking, but they also reveal the complexity of this social issue, and the various strategies human service organizations are using to address this issue.

Purpose and Justification of Project

In this article, the authors offer a working typology of organizational responses to human trafficking mindful of the challenges they face in appreciating the variations in those responses. Their objectives were to (1) create a working typology of these organizations given how they portray themselves through their websites, (2) reveal the scope of social and other supports these organizations offered victims of human trafficking, and (3) illuminate the transnational interactions among the organizations across the border, given that many victims move through Mexico from Central America to reach the United States (Noyori-Corbett & Moxley, 2016). Those people, largely women and children, experience victimization by cartels, gangs, militias, and organized crime syndicates who see trafficking in forced labor, forced marriage and sex slavery as lucrative ventures.

Method

With the assistance of a graduate student, the authors identified organizations addressing human trafficking across five states involving Texas, Oklahoma, California, Arkansas and Arizona. They used a screening checklist that enabled them to identify those organizations working with people who had experienced human trafficking. Through an iterative process of screening, the research team selected 99 organizational websites that were a product of multiple searches using multiple key word search terms. Fields of the screening tool were focus of services, scope of service provision, orientation to the social issue of human trafficking, and features of coordination and/or collaboration.

The application of the screening checklist offered the authors a way of establishing the focus of an organization on human trafficking. Once the team selected an organization and then reviewed it they undertook a content analysis of a site. This content analysis allowed for the further identification of the type of service provision an organization undertook with victims of human trafficking. The authors then assigned a specific focus to each of the organizations involving social service provision, residential care, health care, mental health care, or law enforcement.
Organizational Responses - Social service response to human trafficking

One of the principal forms of response involves outreach to victims who come under the detention of the United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE). Direct service providers engage victims in the process of case identification. Local providers offer a core competence in establishing trust with victims to undertake social histories of their plights, and work with federal law enforcement in the identification of perpetrators and interdiction. The organizations interact with law enforcement entities and their personnel, which can involve a complex process of building relationships with victims, and also understanding how victims can be seen as perpetrators by law enforcement personnel. Too often victims are exploited by traffickers to manage the process of human trafficking and so victims themselves may appear as perpetrators.

Social service organizations on the border likely receive victims after interdiction by law enforcement personnel. They may serve as the front line entity facilitating the permanency of victims through legal assistance as well as facilitating resettlement. Such organizations are likely principal providers of psychological support, vocational training, and short term housing options. Their advocacy can influence whether a victim remains in the United States. As a principal support system for victims, the organizations can incorporate trauma-informed care and therefore their approaches to victimization can incorporate mental health care, as well, or they may collaborate with mental health treatment providers.

Residential care for victims of human trafficking

The trauma of human trafficking for its victims and their displacement is a serious negative consequence of this social issue. Residential providers for rescued victims can involve both intensive and long term care or support, especially as victims navigate the complexity of the legal system, validate their victimization, and address the demands inherent in long term resettlement. Brief residential care can move victims out of harm's way immediately. Nonetheless the long term nature of recovery may demand more supportive forms of housing as victims move through their own processes of adjustment.

Victims face limited access to residential care, since many states on the border lack such availability. Some states may reserve beds for human trafficking victims in those organizations that do not offer a specialized response to human trafficking. California, however, appears to be a front runner in the provision of residential beds for human trafficking victims. Those programs that do specialize in the provision of residential options and support identify long term continuity of care as important for their users. Such continuity is yet another reflection of the complexity and severity of the consequences of human trafficking. Blending case management, counseling, concrete assistance with benefits, spirituality, family reintegration, and medical and substance use treatment within the residential continuum is indicative of a best practice.

The scope of this kind of service provision reveals that human service providers must address the process of recovery and resettlement as well as social integration. The long term nature of care requires such providers to extend support past the time victims leave intensive treatment and transition into community living. Those experiencing human trafficking may make their own transitions—from victims to survivors. Those who see themselves as survivors may extend peer support to those who are coming into residential services in the acute phase of victimization.

Health care provision to human trafficking victims

Human traffickers can induce four kinds of health related problems among those who are victims (Shandro et al, 2016). Those involve physical, sexual, psychological, and enforced substance use. Punitive tactics used by Traffickers can induce considerable physical damage like restraints and enforced isolation or solitary confinement can further exacerbate psychological effects including anxiety and depression. Food and sleep deprivation can weaken victims physically. Unprotected sex combined with forced prostitution can increase the risk of infectious disease among victims.

Human trafficking responses can occur in the emergency room of local health care providers. Victims may present themselves with urgent needs, and it may not be clear to health care providers that the person they assess in the emergency or urgent care context is a victim of human trafficking. Those health care entities that enhance assessment through the inclusion of nurses and social workers who understand the signs of abuse augment case identification. In turn, collaboration with law enforcement can enhance health care provision to those who are victims of human trafficking.

Those organizations that collaborate with health care providers form referral networks integrating social service, legal, crisis, and residential responses. The effectiveness of the health care referral system is contingent on the networks of organizations that have formed to address human trafficking on the border. Medical social workers are vital lynchpins in the helping process since it is this professional discipline that can form and coordinate networks of care for individuals who are victims of human trafficking. To abate anxiety among human trafficking victims, linkage to legal services as early as possible can increase morale among those who fear either arrest or deportation.

Mental health care for victims of human trafficking

Not only can victims experience considerable trauma but the legal response to human trafficking may introduce considerable ambiguity, especially as it
pertains to permanency, and the receipt of visas that recognize the person’s status as a victim of human trafficking (T-visas). Mental health services are essential to helping victims recover from the multiplicity of negative consequences in which physical, psychological, emotional and sexual abuse can be prominent. Crisis intervention is an important service factor in the recovery process in which mental health professionals help victims by addressing their immediate situations, the possibility of continued threat by traffickers, and the stress that law enforcement can create. Addressing the negative consequence of labor exploitation, forced domestic servitude, or forced sex work may make it difficult for victims to take action on their own behalf.

Mental health providers not only serve in victim assistance roles, but they also can combine therapy with advocacy in a form of clinical case management. The mental health provider may need to mix a number of roles to help victims as they transition through the immediate period of rescue and as they begin the process of transition. The mental health professional may be the sole person with whom a victim, often times women and children, can relate and form a trusting relationship. Formation of this trusting bond is likely critical in the early phases since victims may be unable to participate in group support or therapy because of mistrust of others. Some victims who were exploiting other victims at the behest of traffickers may require a different protocol of mental health care.

The duality of law enforcement

Law enforcement officials may play a critical role in supporting victims of human trafficking. They can assist victims with obtaining assistance in terms of connecting with providers, and they may support victims in temporary shelter. They may work closely with those providers at the point of interdiction, and in case identification. And, they can facilitate access to legal services for victims.

But law enforcement officials are concerned about interdiction, and they can create considerable stress for victims through protracted interviews, threats of return to the country of origin, and demands for cooperation. Those organizations focusing on law enforcement may recognize this inordinate stress their methods can create for victims, and they can humanize the process through the involvement of victim advocates, social service or mental health providers, or peer support specialists, that is, peer advocates. An ultimate paradox is that the organizations focusing on law enforcement may coerce victims into taking responsibility for perpetrating crimes in which they engaged involuntarily. Some law enforcement organizations operating on the border recognized this potentiality and therefore put in place victims’ rights protection, and collaborative arrangements with providers. Such a balanced approach not only can humanize law enforcement actions, but also can assist victims to obtain the immediate assistance they require.

Conclusion

All of the organizations the authors examined were not pure types. They organized them by dominant type since many of the organizations incorporated an array of service provision, or extended their reach through collaboration or coordination. Most of the organizations combined assistance of victims of human trafficking with assistance to other groups including those experiencing violence, domestic violence, or refugee resettlement. Most of the organizations used the identifier of victim to communicate the severity of violation experienced by the people to whom they lent assistance.

Organizations offering social services or housing support tended to use the identifier of survivor, since many of these agencies reached out to victims well after the acute period when victims were literally survivors of human trafficking. Those organizations tended to incorporate people who survived human trafficking and likely they operated in roles commensurate with peer support in mental health organizations. Alternatively, those organizations responding to individuals they characterized as victims tended to incorporate multiple personnel including professionals, lay helpers, and volunteers.

Collaboration is characteristic of those organizations that focus exclusively on human trafficking. Alternatively, those responses to human trafficking operating out of family service organizations focused less on locality based collaboration. The handful of organizations that incorporated transnational efforts, those cutting across the border, were also likely to operate across multiple states in the United States. Collaboration therefore is not always a central strategy across organizations responding to human trafficking.

Overall, through these reviews, the authors were also able to identify two principal paradigms of organizational response to human trafficking: treatment orientation with a focus on trauma informed care and advocacy-oriented with a focus on facilitating the movement of victims or survivors to safe situations as they help people to establish their status within the United States.

For the authors, the next steps in the research is to further expand these paradigms, examine organizational configurations, and deepen their appreciation for the organizational cultures of response. Moving from the website analysis to interviews of organizational actors and selected site visits will produce richer data about responses to the serious social issue of human trafficking.

References


Anti-oppressive Practice in Anti-trafficking Interventions in Nepal

A significant number of stakeholders are working on anti-trafficking interventions and have played a substantial role in both preventing trafficking and protecting trafficking survivors with a focus on rescue and reintegration. This article examines how various stakeholders, including Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), educators, media representatives, police officials, lawyers, and the community as a whole, have defined “successful” reintegration. The goals of this article are two-fold: (1) to explore the range of programs and services available to survivors to assist in the process of reintegration; and (2) to unpack what the construct of “successful” reintegration actually means to stakeholders, as this subjective standpoint will have an impact on the design, delivery and evaluation of the programs and services. Participatory action research was used as a tool to construct and refine knowledge around the two goals, and the article’s content is based on the research production of eight female trafficking survivors, recognized as co-researchers in this paper, who interviewed a range of stakeholders, and analyzed the resulting data by coding and categorizing. The findings of the study, together with implications for social work practice, will be discussed in this article.

Context

By signing the TIP (Trafficking in Persons) 2000 Protocol, Nepal, as a source country for trafficking in persons for both sexual and labor exploitation, has demonstrated the Government’s commitment to prevent trafficking and protect survivors through the use of the “3Ps” (Prevention, Protection and Prosecution) approach (Dhungel 2017). National plans, laws, and policies, and a variety of other approaches, such as the National Plan of Action against Trafficking in Persons, Trafficking in Women and Children 2012, and Human Trafficking and Transportation Control Act 2007, are concrete evidence of the Government’s ongoing attempts to support anti-trafficking efforts. In collaboration with the Government of Nepal, Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) working in anti-trafficking efforts have played a crucial role, mainly in preventing trafficking and protecting survivors, however, the Government of Nepal’s role in protecting victims is surprisingly limited (Chaulagai, 2009; Dhungel, 2017; Sharma 2014). There is also limited research assessing how many trafficked women have successfully reintegrated into their families and communities, and what the indicators for successful reintegration actually are, however some studies claimed that reunifications of trafficking survivors with their families and their participations in income generating activities in the areas of agriculture and small businesses are major evidences of “successful” reintegration (Adhikari, 2011; Buet, Bashford & Basnyat, 2012; Chaugalai, 2009; Shakti Samuha, 2013).

Additionally NGOs often experience difficulties in supporting victims and providing services meeting their aspirations due to insufficient funding and unclear reintegration policies (Dhungel 2017). Although most grants coming from foreign governments and International Non-Government Organizations (INGOs) often go directly to the Government of Nepal for anti-trafficking initiatives, the money frequently does not reach those for whom it is intended, due to the various forms of corruption. (Adhikari, 2011; Chaulagai, 2009) and nepotism (Dhungel, 2017). Not surprisingly, given this state of affairs, the United States has placed Nepal in the Tier 2 rank of countries due to its noncompliance with the minimum standards of TIP protocol (United States of Department of State, 2018).

Methodology

Participatory Action Research (PAR), as a community-based research, was selected as the most appropriate method for knowledge creation. PAR offers an opportunity for people (especially oppressed populations) to critically and collectively analyze existing social, political, and economic situations, and
act together to address immediate problems and advocate for social change. This method changed the traditional “objective” role of the researcher to one of a “committed” co-investigator or facilitator, and the customary participant role as “informant”/subject evolves to one of “co-researcher” in the research process (Herr & Anderson, 2005). The eight female trafficking survivors who acted as co-researchers in this collaborative study process, ranged in age from 23 to 37. The women were born outside of Kathmandu, mainly in rural communities, and were first trafficked from the ages of 7 to 25. Four survivors were married, and four of them had children. With respect to their faith, five were Hindus and three were Buddhists. All the women were currently employees of the anti-trafficking agency, Shakti Samuha, Nepal.

The two qualitative approaches, semi-structured individual interviews and conversation cafés, were used to understand how stakeholders perceived the term “successful” reintegration. The co-researchers were involved in developing questionnaires for interviews and facilitating both the interviews and conversation cafés together with analyzing the resulting data. The stakeholders included the Government of Nepal, NGOs working in anti-trafficking interventions (19 agencies), media representatives, lawyers, police officials, educators and the general public. The key findings of the study will be briefly discussed in the following section.

Unpacking “Successful” Reintegration

The agencies working on anti-trafficking interventions were asked to describe the programs and services they had for survivors in their reintegration. Agencies reported that once the survivors are back to Kathmandu, they are taken to a rehabilitation center close to their home community (there is 14 rehabilitation centers), where they could stay from six months to one year (The process for the reintegration of trafficking survivors in shown in figure 1). The goal of the center is to support women in the initial steps of the journey of reintegration.

A rehabilitation center provides a number of services such as counselling, food/clothing and legal services. The centers also offer some recreational activities for physical and health wellbeing, together with some vocational trainings such as knitting, jewelry making, jam making, and opportunities for both informal (adult education) and formal (grade 1-12) education in public schools. At the same time, the organizations attempt to meet families and communities to prepare for family reunification purposes. The agencies first verify if survivors are safe to go back to their families/communities and, if so, they ask their families to welcome the survivors back to their communities. The survivors can maximum stay in a shelter for 12 months, and once they leave the shelter their names are added to the list of the “successful” reintegration survivors and their files are closed.

One question, revealed a significant diversity of answers, showing a lack of consistency in how stakeholders understand integration in the Nepalese context. When asked, “In your opinion, what percentage of women are successfully reintegrated in Nepal?” the answers ranged from forty- to eighty-percent, with half the respondents declining to answer at all, as they were not certain about the actual percentages. Stakeholders, however, were more confident in their replies to this question: “What is your understanding of the term successful reintegration of trafficking survivors?” The responses are illustrated in Figure 2, overleaf.

![Flowchart diagram of the reintegration process](image-url)

**Figure 1. Programs/services and the process for reintegration**

Source: Adapted from Dhungel (2017), p. 337.
A majority of participants reported that family acceptance is instrumental for successful reintegration. To be reunited with parents and siblings, and to live with them stands as a symbol of successful reintegration. The study also found that community acceptance is another important indicator stakeholders used to measure the reintegration success of trafficking survivors. Stemming from this, participants expressed a belief that in many cases, a survivor is accepted by her family but rejected by her community. Therefore, without community acceptance, a survivor’s reintegration is only partial and incomplete. In fact, it could be argued that this is not actually reintegration at all. Additionally, according to stakeholders, a married survivor is perceived as a more successfully reintegrated woman in the society. Participants reported that getting married for survivors is a challenge due to stigma attached to them. Until a survivor gets married she is not considered reintegrated by the participants.

This study also found that employers generally do not hire survivors regardless of education, skills, and experiences once their trafficked past came to their attention. According to stakeholders, employers are afraid that if they hired the survivors they would ruin the image of their organizations. As a result, according to participants, survivors are expected to work mostly in restaurants, and massage parlors. The study highlighted the importance of survivors being able to make a sustainable living in a job of their choice. A small number of stakeholders also expressed concern about survivors’ rights to live with respect and dignity in the society with their future secured. For instance, the participants said that survivors should be entitled to live with the same respect and dignity as any other women, and no one should be able to take away those rights. One participant said, “Women should not be discriminated against based on their past”. A handful of participants suggested that the government should provide free health services to survivors (healthcare is private in Nepal). For example, one participant shared that

We spend enormous amounts of money for the medical treatment of our women. One visit costs Rupees five-hundred. Medicine is even more costly. Our funding is often spent for their medical treatment and thus we sometimes could not even focus on their basic needs. The government needs to promote healthy lifestyles and well-being of the women through free public health services.

Another participant narrated that

“expenses for health care is ridiculously expensive. Most survivors especially those who are diagnosed with HIV Aids are required to take medicines daily and they are, sadly, not in positions to pay for the medicines.”
Most participants reported that survivors' futures should be secured by providing them sustainable employment and appropriate education. This study identified the Nepalese Government as having the responsibility to ensure that these changes occur. Participants also suggested that to prod the government into action survivors need to take initiative to bring their reintegration issues into a public forum, through a variety of channels including storytelling, awareness raising campaigns and policy advocacy. In the words of one stakeholders:

“Taking initiatives and playing a lead role in responding to their own oppressions is reintegration for me. You need to stand for yourselves as part of your own reintegration.”

However, while unpacking the term “successful” reintegration from stakeholders’ standpoints, the co-researchers did not always agree with some of the indicators that stakeholders shared in the interviews, such as the meaning of “marriage”, together with family and “community acceptance”. One co-researcher, for instance, reported:

I do not care if my family accept me or not. I really mean it. I am surprised why marriage is important to our lives- it is just a societal thought. Women are not completed until they get married and I do not believe in that...you know. They do not even know what we want in our lives and how we think reintegration should be.

Another co-researcher echoed her comments and added:

I agree... I do not want to live with my brothers and also the community that always discriminate me and blame on my own vulnerability. I rather prefer to stay on my own and do the things that I want to do. If we make money and become rich I am sure they will come to us and treat us differently.

Conclusion

The implications of the study for social work practice are significant. There is a disconnect between the perceptions of the stakeholders and the reality of the co-researchers when it comes to the actual meaning and practical experience of “successful” reintegration. Programs available for survivors would be more supportive and effective if they helped survivors define their own aspirations and outcomes, and engage with them in the process of developing reintegration laws, policies and programs. The need for the development of reintegration laws and policies grounded in survivors' experiences is of critical importance. It is also important to amend health policies to make the public health care system accessible to survivors, and provide free medication for HIV affected people in their reintegration.

This study suggests that reintegration is intertwined with multi-layered systems of social injustice and gender violence, and that solutions must take all these structural factors into account. The study proposes some specific practice-oriented recommendations for change, for instance, to focus on the aspirations of survivors while conducting assessments of survivors, and develop programs based on these aspirations, instead of simply focusing on the mandate of donors and NGOs is essential. Additionally, an integrative programs and services developed outside of patriarchal paradigms and an integrative rights-based approach instead of a victim-centered approach in programs and services for survivors' "successful" reintegration are indispensable. Overall, this study reveals that a community-based collaborative study is needed to investigate the numerous under-researched areas affecting survivors, particularly those that require government, agencies, survivors, citizens, and academia to work together, and allow all the players to identify and critically understand issues of reintegration, develop strategies to address those issues and act collectively and collaboratively to address them. Most importantly, this process should involve and be led by the survivors themselves.

References


How to develop a social justice framework to support migrant sex workers and prevent the harm caused by anti-trafficking initiatives

Human trafficking is a subject of increasing national and international attention. Social workers are involved in developing policies, initiatives, and programs to increase public awareness of trafficking and to identify and protect trafficked victims. “Rescue” by law enforcement and “identification of victims” by services providers are being recognized as effective strategies to protect victims of trafficking in the sex industry. Those interventions may, however, be harmful without an understanding of the complexity of anti-trafficking issues, discourse, and policy. The author will use the anti-trafficking initiatives in Canada as a case study to analyze how such interventions may be harmful to migrant sex workers. They not only increase investigation, surveillance, and stigmatization of migrant sex workers; they also obstruct their access to services, support, and protection. This article will also illustrate how to develop a social justice framework to protect the trafficked victims and prevent the harm caused by anti-trafficking interventions.

Context
Over the past few decades human trafficking has become a subject of increasing national and international attention. It has been acknowledged that social workers are important agents in the effort to ensure the rights of trafficked victims. They are involved in developing policies, initiatives, and programs to increase public awareness of trafficking and to identify and protect trafficked victims. Those interventions may, however, be harmful in the absence of an understanding of the complexities of the trafficking issue and without critically examining the anti-trafficking discourse, initiative, and policy. It is also essential to recognize that the anti-trafficking interventions can be the tool not only to protect, but also to oppress. Many scholars, researchers, sex workers’ organizations, and activists argue that anti-trafficking measures in fact perpetrate additional harm on the individuals they are ostensibly trying to protect, and in particular migrant sex workers (De Shalit & van der Meule, 2015; GAATW, 2018; NSWP, 2019).

Harm caused by anti-trafficking measures: experiences from Canada
Migrant sex workers are negatively affected by anti-trafficking legislations and initiatives in Canada, especially when sex work is conflated with human trafficking. Under the guise of anti-trafficking initiatives, raids of sex work establishment by police, by law officers and immigration authorities has increased, resulting in arrest and deportation of migrant sex workers. (CASWLR, 2019; Centre for Feminist Research, 2017; Lam, 2018; SWAN, 2015)

Canada has criminalized sex work since the nineteenth century, inheriting British prostitution laws. Sex workers and sex workers’ organization (Bedford v Canada) challenged that criminal provisions successfully -- including communicating, living off the avails, and bawdy house offences -- on the grounds that it violated section 7 of the Charter of Rights and Freedoms, covering constitutional rights to life, liberty, and security of the person. The Supreme Court of Canada struck down those three Criminal Code provisions as unconstitutional. However, with the strong lobbying by abolitionists, the Conservative government introduced Bill-36, the Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act (PCEPA), which defines all sex workers as victims, and prostitution as sexual exploitation, and aims at abolishing prostitution. Under the new criminal laws the third party and the client are criminalized, as well as such sex work related activities as public communication in some areas.
advertising sexual services, and so on. The anti-human trafficking argument is a strong one to justify criminalization of sex work. Many studies, though, have identified “the criminalization of sex work, their clients and third parties as a key contributor to violence experienced by sex workers, among other repercussions, including stigma and discrimination” (CASWLR, 2017).

Canada has ratified the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (Palermo Protocol) in 2002. It has also enacted immigration and criminal laws and released a National Plan to combat human trafficking. Responses to and interventions in trafficking by services providers, law enforcement, and government officials have steadily increased in the past two decades, particularly in the context of the sex industry. Sex workers, especially migrants, are regarded as trafficked victims who need to be identified, rescued, and protected (Lam, 2018; Lepp, 2018).

Many scholars, researchers and sex workers’ organizations argue that current anti-trafficking initiatives are harmful to sex workers. They criticize the conflation of sex work and trafficking in anti-trafficking initiatives; the criminalization of sex work and migration; surveillance and arrest of sex workers; racist and discriminatory immigration measures that prevent them accessing safety, services, and support (Butterfly, 2018; CASWLR & PIVOT, 2016; Lam, 2018; Lepp, 2018; Centre for Feminist Research, 2017). The negative impacts -- criminalization, marginalization, and immigration control – of trafficking policy on migrant sex workers have been documented (GAATW, 2018). Migrant sex workers are targeted by law enforcement through surveillance, racial profiling, arrest, detention, and deportation in the name of “rescue”. The agency and human rights of sex workers and migrants are denied under the terms of the currently dominant anti-trafficking framework that conflates sex work with trafficking (Butterfly, 2018; CASWLR, 2018; Lam, 2018; Lepp, 2018; SWAN, 2015; Centre for Feminist Research, 2017).

Conflation of sex work and trafficking

The development of the anti-trafficking discourse, initiative, and public policy is strongly influenced by radical feminist and abolitionist (prohibitionist) groups. They have succeeded in putting sex trafficking on the international and national agenda and influenced policy makers with their economically and politically powerful lobby (Chuang, 2010; O’Connell Davison, 2006). Weitzer (2007) argues the coalition of religions right and radical feminists creates the moral panic by constructing migration and sex work into the danger of society and the problem of trafficking.

International policies on trafficking, including the International Agreement for Suppression of the “White Slave Traffic” (1904 & 1910), the International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women of Full Age (1933), and the Convention on Elimination of Violence against Women (1979), strongly focus on sex work and migration. The definitions of trafficking in international laws are often vague and ambiguous and conflate sex work with trafficking and migration (Chuang, 2010; NSWP, 2019). The United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children contextualizes trafficking as organized crime, and focuses on arrest and prosecution, rather than addressing vulnerabilities and protection of human rights. “The Protocol and its emphasis on arrest and prosecution enable laws and policies that target sex
workers, third parties, clients of sex workers, and migrant communities generally in the name of ending trafficking” (NSWP, 2019, p.3).

Many international and sex workers’ organizations oppose the conflation of sex work with trafficking because it is harmful to sex workers, particularly migrants (CASWLR & PIVOT, 2016; GAATW, 2018; NSWP, 2019). It criminalizes sex work (including the sex worker, the third party, and the client); pushes sex work underground; increases surveillance, investigation, arrest, raids, and abuse by law enforcement; increases sex workers’ vulnerability to violence and exploitation; and prevents them accessing social services and support (Amnesty International, 2016; CASWLR & PIVOT, 2016; GAATW, 2018; NSWP, 2019).

The conflation of sex work with trafficking is informed by racism and xenophobia. In 2002, Canada introduced provisions in the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act, and to the Criminal Code in 2015, to criminalize human trafficking and human smuggling. Despite the government’s statement that the purpose of the laws is to protect victims, migrants are targeted. Section 185 of the Immigration and Refugee Protection Regulations (IRPR) prohibits any migrant (including migrant on tourist, student, refugee claimants and temporary work visas) from engaging in sex work or a related industry, even when they have an open work permit. Migrants are being constructed as danger that they should be controlled in the name of protection against trafficking (Sharma, 2005).

Offences relating to sex work and trafficking negatively impact migrant sex workers’ rights, increasing their isolation and vulnerability to violence. Bruckert & Hannem (2013) suggest that when sex work activities with a third party and with clients are seen as acts of violence or exploitation, actual cases of violence and exploitation in the workplace go unrecognized, and workers are prevented from improving their conditions and from accessing protections and labour rights.

The Global Network of Sex Work Projects (2019) reports that anti-trafficking measures increase vulnerability of sex workers, decrease their safety, and reduces their abilities to report violence and exploitation (include trafficking). Their working condition is deteriorated. Their case study shows that the migrant sex workers in Spain are being pushed to work in dangerous and unprotected areas. Thereby their vulnerability has increased. Sixty percent of migrant sex workers have reported a variety of experiences of violence, and five Asian migrant sex workers have been murdered in Ontario, Canada. Few, however, would report a crime, because they want to avoid detection and arrest (Butterfly & Immigrant Legal Committee, 2018; Lam, 2018; Santini & Lam, 2017). “The criminalization of third parties and clients, in addition to the immigration prohibitions on migrant sex work, contribute to the violence and other human rights violations that sex workers face by preventing them from taking critical steps (e.g. working together to protect their human rights and ensure their personal safety)” (Lam, Santini & Bush, 2017, p.6). It is harmful to all sex workers, including those who are victims of violence, exploitation and, even, trafficking.

Problems with the rescue model

“Rescue model” is accepted as a useful measure to rescue and protect trafficked victims (GAATW, 2007; GAATW, 2018, NSWP, 2019). It is an approach supported by many social workers, activists, and government officials. Involuntary involvement of law enforcement may, however, break the trustful relationship sex workers have with service providers and law enforcement, causing more harm. The Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (2007 & 2018) and NSWP (2019) criticizes the “rescue approach” as not only increasing the marginalization of sex workers and surveillance and abuse by law enforcement: in addition, sex workers, especially migrants, are often arrested and deported.

Anti-trafficking initiatives by law enforcement, such as Operation Northern Spotlight in Canada, force sex workers into involuntary contact with police; the operation often intensifies racial profiling, surveillance, and targeting of Asian migrant sex workers who work in hotels, massage parlours, and other indoor venues, including those who are permanent residents or Canadian citizens (Butterfly, 2018; Lam, 2018; Lepp, 2018; SWAN, 2018). According to the Canadian Alliance for Sex Work Law Reform (2018), “by casting a wide net, police involved in Operation Northern Spotlight have approached, detained, and harassed numerous sex workers where there has been no evidence of coercion, exploitation, or human trafficking”. It also states that sex workers are left confused, frustrated, and traumatized by their interaction with police. “These initiatives are presented as necessary rescue and protection for migrant sex workers, but in fact, they encourage anti-migrant attitudes, racism, and the criminalization and discrimination of sex work” (Lam, 2018, p2).

Butterfly, the Asian and migrant sex workers’ organization, has documented 18 stories of Asian migrant sex workers who were arrested, detained, and deported in anti-trafficking investigations. They reported that they experienced abuse and cruel and inhumane treatment. They also shared their experiences of how the investigation of trafficking and “rescue” turn into anti-sex work and anti-migrant investigations, and how their human rights were violated during the investigation and their detention (Lam, 2018). Mi shared her experiences that “She was detained and locked with chains on her wrists, waist and legs. She felt very humiliated. She understood that she had worked illegally in Canada, but the police were also telling her she was being detained because she was a victim” (Lam, 2018, p.14).

Another migrant sex worker, Fanny, shared her experiences of how an anti-trafficking investigation
turned into investigation of her immigration status. She was arrested and deported when she identified herself as working independently.

“They addressed Fanny to ask her who had helped her with booking her hotel room and requested to see her passport. They also asked whether the workers had a boss, or if anyone was coercing them to work... Fanny appeared in court. The judge told the workers that they had been arrested for working in Canada without permission, and denied bail” (Lam, 2018, p.17).

It is essential to critically examine anti-trafficking laws and policy, and to recognize the negative impact and harm of the “Rescue Model,” including “anti-trafficking rescues” carried out by law enforcement.

Problems with identification of sex workers by services providers

The radical feminists and abolitionists assume that no women are willing to be involved in sex work. All sex workers are forced, particularly migrants, who are victims who need to be rescued, not only by law enforcement, but also by social workers and other helping professionals. They believe that they are being lured into the sex industry, deceived, and coerced, and are so victimized that they are unable to understand their exploited status, to seek help, or to escape the situation by themselves (O’Connell Davison, 2006; Kempadoo, 2005).

Migrant sex workers organizations, Butterfly (2018) and SWAN (2015), have expressed their concern about the red flags, or indicators, being used by social services providers, including social workers: inability to speak English, fear of law enforcement, and avoiding eye contact. They argue that these indicators not only conflate sex work and trafficking, but also are developed from problematic and racist assumptions about sex workers and migrants. The privacy of migrant sex workers is invaded. The agency and autonomy of sex workers are being denied, and their stories are being distorted. It will also compromise the trustful relationship between services providers, social workers, and sex workers. It creates the barriers for migrant sex workers to access support and services.

Social Justice Approach

Instead of the “rescue approach” that marginalizes migrant sex workers, increases their vulnerability, denies their agency, and results in arrest and deportation, an approach based on social justice and human rights should be adopted to support migrant sex workers and promote their rights. It is important to recognize that sex workers and sex workers’ organizations are well positioned to identify and support the victimized and exploited, and to support community initiatives (Canadian Alliance of Sex Work Law Reform, 2019). Sex workers’ organizations have
proposed initiatives and measures that can empower their members, particularly migrant sex workers, to protect their rights and themselves from violence and exploitation, while assisting them in accessing support and services. Recommendations include: recognizing sex work as work; increase sex workers’ power through self organizing; ending the conflation of human trafficking with sex work; decriminalization and destigmatization of sex work; ending discriminatory and racist immigration policies, especially those prohibiting involvement of immigrants in the sex industry; understanding the potential harm of anti-trafficking measures; increasing sex workers’ access to justice and social support; and supporting their involvement in decision making processes (Butterfly, 2018; CASWLR, 2019; Centre for Feminist Research, 2017; Lam & Gallant, 2018; Lam & Santini, 2017; NSWP, 2019).

Sex work is a controversial issue for many social workers, as suggested by Sen and Baba (2017); it is important for practitioners to be aware of, and to examine, their own values and their positions with regard to it. Listen to the voices of migrant sex workers, and respect their agency, whereby they have the right to make their own decisions about their involvement in the sex industry and to have control over their lives.

Conclusion

Anti-trafficking initiatives and strategies that aim to supress sex work through migrant control, criminalization of sex work, and rescue, actually exacerbate the vulnerability of migrant sex workers, and increase their risk of exploitation and trafficking. “Anti-trafficking legislation and initiatives largely target and punish migrant sex workers, rather than protect their labour and human rights (NSWP, 2019). The assumption that sex work is inherently exploitative limits the understanding of the diversity of the lives and realities of migrant sex workers, and the complexity of their needs and concerns. The conflation of sex work with trafficking, and the resulting aggressive enforcement of laws against sex work and trafficking, cause significant harm to migrant sex workers, and prevent them accessing help and support from social service organizations. (Butterfly, 2018; CASWLR, 2018; NSWP, 2019). Social workers are often the biggest advocates for legal and policy changes and develop interventions to bring about social justice for the oppressed. They may, however, cause more harm without critically understanding the issues and measures. It is essential for social workers to listen to the voices of sex workers and their organizations, and to examine their own values and practices critically.

References

Butterfly (2018) Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on Justice and human rights on human trafficking in Canada: How migrant sex workers are harmed by anti-trafficking initiatives and polices


Canadian Alliance for Sex Work Law Reform (October 9, 2018) Sex workers human rights groups oppose police Operation Northern Spotlight (Press Release)


SWAN (2015) Im/migrant sex workers, myths and misconceptions: Realities of the anti-trafficked. Canada


Attitude of Women and Girls to Child Trafficking Prevention Programmes in Bodija Market, Ibadan, Nigeria.

This article investigated the attitude of women and girls to child trafficking and prevention programmes in Bodija market, Ibadan, Nigeria. The women and girls involved were randomly selected from those who have participated in some child trafficking prevention programmes. Variables considered included age, marital status, religion, education, awareness of child trafficking, knowledge of child trafficking and their attitudes. Structured interview schedule was used to collect data and analyzed with simple tables and percentages. Findings showed that there is a significant relationship between the attitude of women and girls to child trafficking and prevention programmes. It was recommended that social workers should raise more awareness and conduct sensitization programmes on child trafficking and prevention should be emphasized.

Introduction and Literature Review

Human trafficking is a global problem. According to the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, (2000) almost every country in the world is affected by trafficking, whether as a country of origin, transit or destination for victims.

Human trafficking relates to the recruitment and transporting of persons through deception, coercion or other means of manipulation for purposes of forced labour, involuntarily servitude, prostitution, sexual abuse, exploitation and enslavement (Flowers, 2006). It is a form of globalized slavery that is closely linked with prostitution (Llewellyn, Agu and Mercer, 2008). Majority of trafficked people come from the poorest parts of the world including Africa, Asia and Eastern Europe. Reports show that Nigeria remains a source, transit, and destination country for women and children subjected to human trafficking including forced labour and forced prostitution. In 2001, Nigeria ratified the United Nations Protocol to prevent, suppress, and punish trafficking in persons especially women and children as well as passed a national law in 2003, Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Law Enforcement and Administration Act 2003. Through this act, the National Agency for the Prohibition of Trafficking in Persons (NAPTIP) was established. Non-governmental organizations like Women Trafficking and Child Labour Eradication Foundation (WOTCLEF) have also been involved in the prosecution of traffickers, protection of victims, rehabilitation, retraining and counseling of repatriated trafficked people (Dave-Odigie, 2007).

Over 10,500 Nigerians have been rescued and repatriated from Libya, according to a national newspaper report. Another report quoted an Edo State Government official stating that no fewer than 100 students of a secondary school in Benin City had been trafficked to Libya recently. The rescue of victims of human trafficking across several states of Nigeria including Abuja, by NAPTIP, state governments, the police and other security agencies is reported in all news media platforms with alarming frequency.

NAPTIP reports that in the period from January to September 2017, it provided protection and assistance to 1,228 rescued victims of human trafficking and 413 per cent or 506 were children under the age of 18.

Although international trafficking for prostitution is a more recent phenomenon in Nigeria, it has climaxed in the last decade and Nigeria is the worst hit African country in the trafficking pandemic (Falola and Afolabi, 2007). In June 2001, a report by the International Labour Organisation (ILO) identified a number of states in Nigeria as center points for child traffickers in terms of both supplying and receiving children as well as acting as transit routes (Human Rights Watch, 2002). It has been going on with the trafficking of people from rural communities to major cities such as Lagos, Abuja,
Kano, Kaduna, Calabar, Warri, and Port-harcourt, predominantly for exploitative domestic work, scavenging, begging and prostitution (Dave-Odigie, 2007). Nigeria has a large number of adolescents living and making a living on the streets (Bamgbose, 2002). Between March 1999 and December 2000, 1,112 Nigerian women were deported from 5 countries for trafficking related reasons. The Nigeria Police Desk Office on human trafficking reported that between 1999 and 2001, over 8633 trafficked persons were deported back to Nigeria. Between 1999 and 2003, 19,774 Nigerians had been deported from Europe for human trafficking offences related to prostitution. As of May 2003 according to the estimates of United States Diplomatic Mission to Nigeria, as many as 300,000 Nigerian women have been trafficked since 1997. Nigeria women constitute more than 50% of all Africans who have been trafficked anywhere in the world (Falola and Afolabi, 2007).

While it is an established fact that most trafficked African women agree to migrate for the sake of better economic prospects, some of them are just kidnapped and trafficked for prostitution against their wishes (Falola and Afolabi, 2007). On the scene, human trafficking is motivated and continue to thrive because of poverty, ignorance, selfishness, greed and lack of state capacity to translate policy into action. The result of the harsh economic realities in Nigeria such as lack of job opportunities for both its skilled and unskilled labour, lack of welfare package to cater for the needs of the unemployed and ignorance have contributed to its sustenance. Furthermore, due to social change because of rapid urbanization, education, globalization and harsh economic conditions there has been a decline in traditional and cultural values. Rapid urbanization led to alteration of the extended family and community forms of solidarity. Corruption and ineptitude of security agents charged with border security is also an important factor in the sustenance of human trafficking in Nigeria (Dave-Odigie, 2007).

To stem the rising tide in human trafficking in Nigeria, the government has set up machineries and embarked on legislations while aligning with international protocols for both preventive and deterrent measures. However, the practice remains entrenched despite initiatives by several governmental and non-governmental bodies (Human Rights Watch, 2002). Dave-Odigie notes further that much still need to be done as the problem still persists because it is a covert activity and thus the extent to which it occurs remains unknown (Dave-Odigie, 2007).

Objective
The general objective of this study is to find out the attitude of women and girls towards child trafficking and prevention programme at the Bodija market in Ibadan.

Methodology
Design: A descriptive survey research design was used for the study. The population of the study covered women and girls who are involved in or aware of child trafficking and prevention programme at the Bodija market.

Study Area: Bodija market is one of the largest markets in Nigeria, it is close to the University of Ibadan and offers an array of foodstuffs. Located conspicuously at the heart of Ibadan, capital city of Oyo State.

A purposive sampling technique was used to draw a sample of 160 women and children from the market.

Instrumentation: The study employed the use of a semi-structured questionnaire for data collection which was subjected to face and content validity through expert review with a test-retest reliability of 0.8.

Data Collection and Analysis: The researcher obtained permission from the market heads ("Iyalolo" and "Babaloja"). Data collected was analysed using descriptive statistics for demographic variables.

Findings and Discussion
The socio-demographic characteristics of respondents on attitude of women and girls to child trafficking gave an insight in order to appreciate the features of respondents. They included sex, age, ethnic group, state of origin religion, occupation and marital status.

Information was collected from a total of 160 respondents. The respondents had a fair awareness and knowledge of child trafficking because some of them have at one time or the other been victims that lead to women and of child trafficking in the market. The age distribution of respondents: more than half of the respondents (56.9%) were aged 16-35 years and 89.0% of the respondents were Yoruba. The prevalence of those respondents from Yoruba ethnic group was because the study was carried out in a Yoruba speaking area. Again, the presence of other ethnic groups shows the cosmopolitan nature of Ibadan city. With regards to religion, the data shows that 26.9% of respondents used in the study practiced Islam while 70.6% were Christians and 1.3% of respondents were practicing other religions while only 1.3% of respondents did not respond to religion.

Again in respect to occupation, 13.1% of respondents were students, 23.1% of respondents used for the study were employed, 32.5% of respondents were self-employed, 8.1% and 11.7% of respondents engaged on other occupation that was not stated while 1.3% of respondents used in the study was silence about their occupation. In regard to educational qualification 53.8% of respondents have no formal education. Pertaining to marital status 52.5% of respondents used in the study were single. On the attitude and awareness of women and girls at Bodija market to child, trafficking/preventions programme, 56.7% of the respondents indicated awareness of child trafficking which is a simple majority while a minority 39.8% of the respondents are aware of NGOs working to stop or prevent child trafficking in Bodija market. On the attitude, 55.2% of the respondents like the child trafficking while 35.7% want it to stop.

Discussion
The result indicates that a large number of women have a laissez faire attitude towards child trafficking 55.2% and 35.7% want it to stop. Many of the girls even desire it thinking that they do not have another option or a way out of poverty, since their parents are unable to provide for their upkeep. In addition, several young girls encourage other girls to engage in child trafficking. The findings were supported by Bales (2007) which states that poverty drives the attitude and
demand for women and children to engage in child trafficking. In most cases, many of these young girls are recruited from neighbouring schools and communities in promise of better job opportunities.

In areas with the attitude rate and high poverty risk rate, people are in constant search for employment and better life, often having undergone years of frustration because of bad living conditions and impossibility of providing for the basic needs. Such a state leads to decreased caution and acceptance of various job offers, without additional background checks and analysis of offered conditions. This implies that trafficking victims are in a very harsh condition that they lack the money to meet basic life needs. In most markets there are well organised syndicates that specialise in recruiting young women and girls for child trafficking. This is supported by Flowers (2011) who opined that pimps and madams play important role in prostitution acting as facilitators and operators using different means to keep the operation running smoothly.

Regarding the attitude of women towards child trafficking, the result of this study indicate that more than half of the respondents (55.2%) like child trafficking while a minority of (35.7%) want it to stop. It is not therefore surprising that most of the respondents believed that there are positive economic gains to be made from child trafficking. Clearly, any programme aiming to stop or prevent child trafficking at Bodija market must try to address the economic realities of women's lives.

Social workers try to inspire a desire for change in the lifestyle of their clients. The prospects for dealing effectively with numerous social problems seems increasingly optimistic. This may be another instance of the triumph of hope over experience. Yet there is not only a growing rigorous research base for some well documented practice methods, but there is also a national groundswell favouring major changes in lifestyle and of social organizations that seek to promote education and well-being. Social workers have the opportunity to renew and to participate in what looks to be the major social-educational revolution of the century: “to aid in the solution of the social and industrial problems which are engendered by the modern conditions of life”.

Prevention as a Means for Attaining Access to Education through the “IEEP” the girl project ieep is an acronym formed from the words inform, enlighten, educate and prepare the girl-child for a good future. The “ieep the girl”-project is currently being proposed as a social work intervention technique to be used by school social work students as they are posted to public schools for their practicum. Trafficking is an item on the unknown burden of the girl-child hence, any programme that will help and empower the girl-child in taking an informed decision to addressing this unknown burden should be encouraged. It has been used by this author and has proved effective in shaping girls’ lives. Folaranmi (2007, 2014). Strengthening human trafficking prevention programs by focusing on the right to education and the right to gainful employment decreases girls and women’s vulnerability to traffickers. As prevention methods, education and gainful employment increase standards of living that help keep women and girls out of the reach of traffickers.

Conclusion
Based on the findings from this study, it was concluded that the attitude of women and girls have strong influences on child trafficking at Bodija market in Nigeria, and this constitute a major hindrance to various prevention programmes. The attitude cuts across various demographic variables which is not unrelated to the prevailing harsh economic realities in Nigeria especially for young women and girls. It is believed that this attitude can best be corrected through education and enlightenment programmes.

Recommendations
• Social workers and other helping professions should raise more awareness and sensitization programmes through all the forms of social media to enlighten people on the negative effects of child trafficking.
• School social workers should discourage young girls in both primary and secondary schools from engaging in child trafficking as a response and way out of poverty, but rather students and pupils should be encouraged on engaging in positive options and legitimate business as responses to poverty and illiteracy.
• Government should extend social security programmes to more women and children population to alleviate economic hardship and poverty in Nigeria.
• Government should enforce the already existing legislation against child and women trafficking in Nigeria.
• Society should promote her cultural values and assist the social institutions within its locality to enlighten families on the disadvantages of child and women trafficking.

References
Falola, T., Afolabi, N. 2007 Introduction Migration Fantasies, Night Marish Realities
International Labour Organization (ILO), 2017 Global employment Trends for Youth: path to a better working future
National Agency for the Prohibition of Trafficking in Persons (NAPTIP) 2003
United Nation's Convention against Transnational organised crime adopted by General Assembly resolution 2000
United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime 2000
Domestic trafficking of children in Ethiopia

This article is on children trafficked, or migrating themselves, from rural areas of the Wolaita zone of Southern Nation Nationalities Peoples Regional State (SNNPRS) in Ethiopia to the nearest city which is Jimma. The article focuses on prevention. The Department of social work, Jimma University, can play a coordinating role in bringing together community based organisations, government and international agencies, in dialogue and co-working. Local efforts need to be recognised, learned from and supported.

Context

The United Nations office on drugs and crime defines human trafficking as ‘the acquisition of people by improper means such as force, fraud or deception, with the aim of exploiting them’ (UNODC, 2016).

This article examines the domestic trafficking of children in the Southern Nation Nationalities region of Ethiopia from the standpoint of service providers and community people/officials. Children between ages seven and fourteen are taken from rural areas to work as cheap labour, sell on the street in Jimma or Addis Ababa and some are sexually exploited (US State Department, 2017). Ayalew et al.’s, (2013) previous study in the region indicated that child trafficking is increasing in Ethiopia.

In the following sections we outline the issues and literature and then the findings of research based on observation, interviews and group discussion. Findings are limited in that interviews were not conducted with children who had been through this. Rather, the objectives of the research undertaken by Asayeberhan Kastro in 2016, were confined to how government, non-government, community-based and volunteer personnel worked to prevent the trafficking in children in southern Ethiopia. The African Report on Child Wellbeing 2016 concludes that addressing child poverty and exploitation demands the coordinated effort of government, non-government and community-based organisations (African child policy forum, (ACPF, 2017).

Those who contributed to this study agree that governments must channel funding to those working at the local level to prevent child trafficking; to shelter and rehabilitate ‘returnees’ and to put more into economic development in rural areas (also Ayansa, 2016). The State must also put money and effort into prosecuting traffickers and accomplices and legislatively protecting children and youth (ARCW, 2016; USSD, 2017).

Reasons children are vulnerable

Belete et al., (2014) who conducted another study on child migration in the Southern Nations Nationalities and Peoples Reginal State (SNNPRS) found poverty, large family size, small land size contributes to child migration and trafficking. The region accounted for 38% of children trafficked within Ethiopia. Among the children, over 40 per cent had lost both of their parents. Datta (2013) similarly states that children orphaned in Kenya were likely to leave school and ‘...plunge headlong into what is a highly exploitative labour market’ because of the need to survive (p.106). They are susceptible to being trafficked into a labour reserve of no rights and protection (UNODC, 2006, p. 70).

The United Nations office on drugs and crime (UNODC, 2016) global synopsis of smuggling and trafficking,
reports only on those ‘detected’ as trafficked. There is cross-over between human smuggling, irregular migrations, and trafficking (McAuliffe and Laczko, 2016, p. 2). Anyone being ‘smuggled’ might become a victim of traffickers, especially women and children (McAuliffe and Laczko, 2016, p. 7).

Increasingly, more vulnerable groups of migrants are moving irregularly, including women and children, raising a raft of complex issues for State and non-State actors alike. (Ibid., p. 12)

Accordingly, females make up one third of those smuggled from the Horn of Africa to Europe. Children are also being smuggled, often on their own (Majidi and Oucho, 2016, p. 64; UNODC, 2016). McAuliffe and Laczko (2016) point to the ‘paucity of reliable data on migrant smuggling’. Official statistics on human smuggling are limited to those ‘apprehended or convicted of smuggling offences’ (p. 25)

Children sometimes travel with their parents or one parent, while others have been sent alone. Those travelling alone face a high risk of being trafficked into labour or sex trade. However, the assumption is that if the children are caught, the law would be lenient enough to allow them to stay in the country. (Majidi and Oucho, 2016, p. 64)

Over forty per cent of trafficking happens within countries, which is the focus of this article (McAuliffe and Laczko, 2016, p. 9). The UNODC (2016) report says that ‘trafficking in persons remains largely a regional and local phenomenon’. Poverty is the main reason children are enticed to leave home. Traffickers might be known to a child or be part of a chain of people involved in the trafficking. A child/youth might not know what is happening. The US state department (2017) urged the Ethiopian government to put more into identifying traffickers who are moving children within the country. That includes children being trafficked to cities for sexual exploitation involving ‘mostly Ethiopian-born perpetrators, including members of the diaspora, with known links to local hotels, brokers, and taxi drivers’ (p. 168).

There are many children and youth who are at risk in a country where 67 per cent of the population suffer ‘severe multidimensional poverty’ and 84 per cent live in rural areas (UNDP, 2016; Teller and Hailemariam, 2011). As spoken of in this and other research, children migrate because a parent/parents have died, they want to eat, their families cannot provide for them, they want what other children have, they think the city will open up to ‘the good life’ or all of the above. They are also opportunely enticed by someone they know or who wins their trust.

The rights of the child

The UN 1989 Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) confirms a global commitment to the rights of children; to prevent and stop the abuse of children and to put their hunger, health and safety to the top of national economic agendas (UNICEF, 2016). Ethiopia adheres to the CRC and has instituted through its Women and Children’s agency, community-based children’s rights committees. The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia constitution (1995) article 36 (d) states that a child has: ‘the right to be protected against exploitative practices, and not to be permitted to engage in any employment which would prejudice its health, education or well-being.’ Article 18(2) speaks directly to human trafficking: ‘No one shall be held in slavery or servitude. Trafficking in human beings for whatever purpose is prohibited.’

The National Social Protection Policy of Ethiopia (2012) identifies the vulnerability of children to trafficking:

vulnerable children could not attend classes because of family’s inability to purchase school uniforms and books, because many do not get adequate food and because a sizable proportion of children are working such long hours that this interferes with their ability to focus on their formal education. There is also limited access to education for children with special needs.

(p. 17)

Children may leave home because they see themselves as a burden or conditions at home are untenable.

In Ethiopia the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs and the Ministry of Women and Children’s affairs (WCA) are the key institutions working to identify and prevent trafficking. Community-based organisations (CBOs), as identified in this study, also play a key role in protecting children and helping families. This includes generating self-employment opportunities, assisting with books and uniforms so children can attend school, and assessment and planning with parentless/widowed families. But many community workers are not paid for the support they give to families.

Research methodology

The research that backgrounds this article was qualitative including interviews with ‘key-informants’ who had been working with child trafficking in the Sodo Town area of the Wolaita zone of Ethiopia. This included persons from the government’s Women and Children’s agency (WCA), World Vision International, the police department, primary school teachers and the bus station’s transport office. There were also two focus groups to explore the role of the local community in combating child trafficking. One focus group included drivers and weyallas who work at the bus stations and members of a bus station surveillance team. Another focus group included representation from government and non-government agencies and...
community-based organisations. All participants were purposively approached because of their knowledge of child trafficking in this region. Children were not interviewed in this study in order to learn from their experiences of being trafficked. Those interviewed were chosen because they are involved with prevention or with reunification of children with their families. Another study also on child trafficking to Jimma Town by Rahel Ayansa (2016) says child victims of trafficking do not want to talk to researchers for fear they will be found out. 'This is true not only for victims still living in exploitative conditions but also for returnees who were victims of trafficking' (p. 13). A 15 year old told Ayansa (2016) that she had been solicited at the funeral of her mother by a female neighbour to work in Jimma.

The woman said I would be paid 800ETB per month, continue my education at night session and I would be treated like a family

Instead she was doing domestic work without pay. According to an older respondent in this study, children discuss among themselves how to get to Jimma or Addis Ababa and the good things that can happen there. And so they are supported by their peers who also want to go.

Moreover, brokers make influence on children by deceiving and presenting false promises that their lives will become better in a short period of time if they migrate rather than staying in miserable situation. Considering their situation...no food to eat, no clothes to wear, no house to stay in so they will easily be entrapped by the brokers snare.

Ayansa (2016) says cultural/economic factors demand children play a role in contributing to the household and children take on the responsibility willingly (p. 31).

What people said

Interviewees confirmed that children leave because of the strain of poverty and increased landlessness on families as the rural population increases. Parents are unable to sustain their families on small holdings.

Poverty leads the family not to send their children to the schools; rather they force them to engage them in child labour, which in turn also most of the time leads the child to become vulnerable to child traffickers. Further, this interviewee says that governmental and nongovernmental anti-trafficking agencies must step up to change the economic capacity of poor and vulnerable groups.

In fact, Adepoju’s (2005) study on human trafficking in African countries indicated that adult relatives sought to benefit from trafficking a dependent child. Parents send their children away thinking their children’s needs will be better met. Economic development in rural locations including access to training, would assist in deterring child exploitation and dangerous adult migrations.

UNICEF (2016) report that children under age 17, ‘make up nearly half (46 per cent) of the [global] population living on less than US$1.90 per day’ (p. 72).

Parents may also believe the traffickers. …because a majority of families in rural areas are engaged in subsidence agriculture and could not afford to send their children to school, the brokers use the advantage of their families to traffic children by giving promises like affording the child’s education and employment.

These people make child trafficking into a ‘safe’ transaction that parents will agree to.

Because parents can contribute to their children being trafficked, we [Women and Children’s] are persuading the parents that their children will benefit from staying on at school. However, if parents simply cannot afford this, the school members are helping very poor children with books and education materials.

A number of informants pointed out that ‘brokers’ trafficking children know how to get around any surveillance happening. One participant confirmed that:

To smuggle the children, brokers use contract buses that they pay double than the legal tariff. The bus always starts the journey in mid nights. Because in the night time there is no surveillance, in most part of the country. The other strategies they designed was brokers did not come with the children rather they gave 200 birr and mobile numbers which they receive [when] children [reach] on their destination.

Representatives of the WCA attend court proceedings at Sodo and Areka towns to observe prosecutions of crimes against children. Interviewees and focus group participants said they wanted training on the existing laws and how they can bring traffickers to prosecution. They wanted perpetrators exposed and charged.

According to the US State Department (2014)
Perpetuating this reliance is that government intervention mechanisms fail to achieve their responsibility. Most of them do not give the necessary attention to the problem as most of government intervention mechanisms fail to achieve their goals. Perpetuating this reliance is that government goals.

Despite more prosecutions which are mainly focused on trafficking across borders, The US State Department's (2015) TIP (Trafficking in Persons) report said the Ethiopian government failed on too many occasions to provide adequate assistance to trafficking victims both those exploited internally or after migrating overseas, relying almost exclusively on international organizations and NGOs to provide services to victims without providing funding to these organizations. This hadn't changed in 2017 as those being helped by NGOs, especially in Addis Ababa, increased in number.

In 2016, Parliament approved a second National Human Rights Action Plan, spanning 2016-2020, which included various activities to curb trafficking, including a media campaign and increased efforts in urban centres to assist women and child victims. However, the government did not report allocating specific funding for the action plan. (USSD, 2017, p. 168)

Community mobilisation
Focus group participants said that community mobilization is crucial to preventing the problem. They also added that the Women's and Children's office in Sodo Town had been working on community mobilization and had organised child rights committees in 11 kebeles [neighbourhoods] of the town.

The main tasks of the mobilization was to mobilize and participate the community in programs such as OVC [orphans and vulnerable children] task force, CRC committee, community based child care programs.

The Women's and Children's Agency (WCA) and the NGO World Vision International have trained those working at the bus station to be aware of traffickers and how they operate. Posters have also been distributed. Teachers are also making children aware of the reality of traffickers and trafficking. They also try their best to accommodate children who cannot afford school books and uniforms.

Those working at the community level said it was hard to get more community involvement in preventing trafficking because people saw it as a government responsibility.

Most of them do not give the necessary attention to the problem as most of government intervention mechanisms fail to achieve their goals.

In 2014, the national trafficking taskforce collaborated with international organizations to launch a community conversations trafficking awareness program, conducted in over 325 neighborhoods with the participation of 25 to 40 residents in each neighborhood session, including local and district officials. (p. 157)

Datta's (2013) research on orphaned and vulnerable children in Kenya, confirms the centrality of community-based organisations in the protection of children because they know the families and their circumstance. According to Datta (2013) 'the community support system does not have formal management structures, systems and paid staff. But the strength of this system lies in its ownership and in the deep-rooted culture of the community.

Many of those working on prevention at the community level, namely the orphans and vulnerable children's committees and the children's rights committees, are volunteers. They can't cover travel expenses nor the resources needed to prevent trafficking that includes public education. Similarly, two temporary shelters have been established in the Sodo Town area to accommodate victims until re-uniting with families. But they cannot accommodate the number of children who need it. They need more beds, food, clothing, medical supplies.

... The children are promised to get enough food and other necessities. However they don't get what they were promised by the reintegrated agencies. The main reason was nobody follow-up reintegrated children, and which also leads them to being re-trafficked. The best solution for this problem is organizing the CRC committees with financial and trained man power, which in turn facilitate the combating process.

An interviewee from the Women and Children's agency said shelters lack a budget to hire the personnel required including social workers and nurses to assist with health, family/kin and emotional issues. 'Re-integration' can fail without sustained and meaningful support. One participant said that before reintegration the family needs to be prepared and provided support as to support their children. A small amount is given to the family to care for a returning child but this gets swallowed up before the child returns home. A child may choose to be 're-trafficked.' These particular areas, children returning to families and children needing shelter require adequate funding and trained personnel including social workers and nurses, as indicated by...
participants (also USSD, 2017). But there also needs to be something to go home to...it's not an easy decision to leave home and all that is familiar to you.

**Building community capacity**

Building on the knowledge and skills of those at the community level trying to prevent trafficking in children can be assisted through university social work programmes. University programs are in the position to bring local people together with national and international agencies as share information, strategies, resources and action – rather than work separately from each other. They can also train volunteers in working with families and developing income generating projects.

**Conclusion**

Both focus groups and interviewees said poverty, limited land size due to population density and loss of parent or parents through death or through migration contribute to increased child trafficking in the Wolaita zone of Ethiopia.

**References**


More financial and human resources needs to be put into prevention at the community level, including the protection of children from exploitation, help with getting them into school and rehabilitation of children who are coming back to their families. This includes community-based social workers to work with families, children and in the school system. It also includes increased government commitment to identifying and prosecuting traffickers, and to working with community people and organisations trying to protect children (USSD, 2017). Ayansa (2016) suggests that the empowerment of women facilitates the well-being and education of children. Rural women in particular, might benefit from access to skills training and credit and community-based organisations can be used to develop and provide relevant skills training (p.38).

Government, non-government and community-based organisations pooling knowledge and resources in a joint preventative strategy to combatting child trafficking and supporting vulnerable families, may result in a cohesive holistic response. The school of social work at Jimma University within its community-development mandate, could play a key role in making this happen.

**Building community capacity**

Building on the knowledge and skills of those at the community level trying to prevent trafficking in children can be assisted through university social work programmes. University programs are in the position to bring local people together with national and international agencies as share information, strategies, resources and action – rather than work separately from each other. They can also train volunteers in working with families and developing income generating projects.

**Conclusion**

Both focus groups and interviewees said poverty, limited land size due to population density and loss of parent or parents through death or through migration contribute to increased child trafficking in the Wolaita zone of Ethiopia.
The experience of male labor exploitation: voices from Ukraine

Numerous of labour exploited men do not consider themselves to be victims of trafficking and/or forced labour survivors and do not refer for assistance. Nevertheless, some studies provide evidence that they experienced awful labour and living conditions, nourishment as well as lack of medical aid. Moreover, some of them experienced different types of abuse. To address the problem, social workers should use the holistic approach while working in the following four interrelated areas: prevention, prosecution, protection, and partnership.

According to the recent statistic data, 21 million people across the world became victims of forced labour, amongst which 11.4 million women and girls and 9.5 million men and boys (ILO, 2016). However, these figures do not provide any understanding of the precise number of victims of human trafficking for the purpose of labour (Hofmeister & Rueppel, 2014).

In Ukraine, there is no official statistics which could describe the real situation, but there is a number of those receiving support e.g. the Victims of Trafficking of Human Beings (VoT). For instance, more than 2.5 thousand males have received assistance from the International Organization for Migration within the last five years. Since males do not consider themselves as victims of trafficking and do not refer for assistance, the number of them may be significantly higher.

The current article is based on the study outcomes which was held by the author in 2016 in Ukraine, Moldova and Belarus (Gusak, 2016) show that the main country of destination for the victims of trafficking is Russian Federation; 15-20% of victims return from the countries-members of the European Union and the scope of domestic THB is less than 3%. Furthermore, most of males were exploited during the period between one to three months in construction work as well as in agriculture, forest sector and at gas supply facilities. The main sources of information on the work related to exploitation were relatives, friends and acquaintances. Moreover, most victims did not have enough preliminary information on potential work, its location, conditions etc. and, as a rule, they were not making any attempts to check the work they had as they fully trusted the recruiters and relied on them for everything.
Within the study framework there were 116 male victims of THB from Ukraine interviewed on their experience of exploitation. The following topics have been chosen for the analysis: labour conditions, living conditions and nourishment, medical aid and abuse experience.

**Labour conditions**
Labour conditions of men, as a rule, did not meet the standards of labour laws and safety code requirements. Most of them worked in dangerous conditions and had a large workload.

Working hours were irregular and the employers could make people work extra time at any time by providing the following rationales for it: the requirements of the working process, the need to maintain the schedule of commissioning the construction site to the customer. In general, for most people the working day was between 12 and 16 hours. In addition, many men were voluntarily agreeing to work extra time as they were convinced that they would be paid more and it would enable their quick return home. While working extra time over the norm, most respondents did not have any holidays, and some of them indicated the lack of breaks for rest during the working day. Though part of them indicated that they had an opportunity to have at least one day off weekly, but they had not used it. One of the reasons was their willingness to earn more, the other – lack of costs and impossibility to leave the area where they stayed. More than half of respondents did not have an opportunity to leave the construction site territory where they were exploited. Thus some of them were restrained by employers in movement by being forbidden to leave the territory and threatened with punishment (beating or penalty), and the others were threatened by the employers with possible negative consequences. Part of them could leave the territory only under strict control i.e. being accompanied by a guardian or a foreman, and some men were under permanent supervision and were not able to move freely even across the site territory.

**Living conditions and nourishment**
Most men lived at the territory of the site where they worked. Most of those who worked at the construction lived at the unfinished premises of the site where they have been exploited. Quite a widespread practice was living in trailers and barracks located at the sites, as well as in the premises not intended for living, such as greenhouses, basements, garages and storage rooms (barn). There was the practice of living in hostels quite often used by men working at enterprises and factories. In some cases the respondents independently rented lodging.

Almost in all the places there were inappropriate living conditions, such as lack of conditions to store and to cook food, to manage personal hygiene, rest etc. Living conditions of those who were exploited during the autumn-spring period were even worse as there was a no heating in the premises where they lived. Some respondents mentioned that there was a lack of drinking water.

Two-thirds of men informed that they cooked food for the construction crew members on their own, from the food brought by the employer. In addition to that they mentioned the low quality of food products which was even worsened with the time being, as well as its low calorific value. They were having mainly porridges, potatoes, flour-based food etc. Meat and fish were almost lacking. If at the beginning the workmen could enhance their ration with the food they brought from home (pig fat ('salo'), canned food etc), but eventually they ran out of these supplies.

The significant part of those working in agriculture had to eat mainly the food which was gathered (tangerines, grapes, apples etc). Some men indicated that they had chronic diseases resulted from such kind of nourishment (diabetes, problems with teeth, diseases of the digestive tract).

**Medical aid**
Almost all the respondents indicated that they did not have any access to adequate medical aid when being exploited. Most of those who had complicated situations (traumas, acute conditions of chronic diseases, colds etc) treated themselves on their own buying their own medicine or using folk remedies. At the same time if the health condition did not have a significant effect on working capacity, the men continued working without referring for medical aid. Only few respondents indicated that there was a first-aid station there or a first-aid kit at the construction site, and the resources of the latter were very limited.

In the case of workers’ serious traumas or diseases, the employers applied the strategy when they were taking the men out of the site territory and informed the emergency on their condition and location.

**Experiencing abuse**
The most widely spread form of male abuse was an economic one which concerned remuneration of labour. Most men informed that employers promised payments for the work of no less than 500 dollars a month. However, none of the respondents received it in full.

Part of the men did not receive any payments for the whole period of exploitation. It specifically concerns those who worked at the enterprises and were eating at the cafeteria and with the food delivered to them to the construction site. In some cases, employers were explaining that the entire amount earned was spent on the allowance for men (food, accommodation, paying fines), and they do not owe anything to them. In other cases, employers used different means of postponing payments, specifically they promised to pay the entire amount immediately after the whole scope of work would be done, commissioning the building site, receiving costs from the customer etc. In addition, there were cases when respondents were hired for the unpaid trial period.

There were other cases when men were not receiving any payments on their own initiative as they hoped to receive the full amount on completion of their work or did not have any conditions to keep the earnings safe, and they were trusting it to the employer. Some of
them hoped that the money would be transferred to their bank account.

Other respondents were able to receive only a small part of earned money. Some of them were paid in advance and they used the payment for subsistence and vital functions during this period. Sometimes all the remuneration for the work was limited to the size of this advance payment. In many cases reimbursement of the return ticket home was the only thing provided to victims. Employers/exploiters were buying return tickets to the home city by themselves or were given the amount equal to their cost.

One of the types of economic abuse experienced by the men was that employers were taking away their mobile phones and tablets from them which could be used for communication with relatives.

Most of the respondents interviewed had immediate experience of physical abuse. Men were abused in order to make them work when they did not agree with the work conditions suggested or in cases when they violated the employers’ requests (were leaving the territory without permission, were late for work etc) as well as in case of their attempt of escape.

Psychological abuse was manifested via threats and intimidation, and, as a result, the respondents experienced fear for their life and health and had to work further for free.

**Conclusion and social works response**

Firstly, social workers should develop the special emphasis on preventing male trafficking in cooperation with government agencies from the social and education systems, law enforcement, other international organizations as well as a network of civil society organizations. Because male VoT in fact have lack of information on their rights, peculiarities of crossing the border, requirements on employment in the country of destination and groundless trust to occasional acquaintances that make them vulnerable to THB. Consequently, the actual need is in informing on the need to consider the risks while getting employed abroad, specifically, on the following: do not handle the documents to anyone, to have costs for the return ticket home and to put money on the mobile phone account, to inform close people on one’s own place of stay, contacts of employer and negotiator etc.

Secondly, social workers can suggest special training programs to police, investigators, prosecutors, and the judiciary system representatives.

Thirdly, comprehensive reintegration assistance should be provided to VoTs, depending on individual needs, which includes legal consultation and representation in criminal and civil court; medical care, psychological counselling, shelter, vocational training, a small-grant programme supporting those trafficking survivors who aspire to set-up their own business and other forms of assistance. For instance, the actual services could be the following: legal (the ways of verification of employers; assistance in making contracts; methods of collecting evidence base on labor exploitation); information services (placing the information on dishonest employers at the Internet/social networking sites; informing on the organizations providing assistance to VoT; informing on risks and coping strategies to address risk situations in which the males being exploited could get into); behavior skills training for risk situations.

Representatives from government agencies, international organizations, civil society, private companies etc. at the IOM Conference, Kyiv, Ukraine, 2018.

Finally, all the above would be possible due to close cooperation between various stakeholders: government agencies, international organizations, civil society, private companies and individuals.

**References**


(Left) Students of the School of Social Work created several posters considering different aspects of human trafficking. At the National University of Kyiv-Mohyla Academy, Ukraine, 2017
Children Of Commercial Sex Workers (CSWs): Understanding Vulnerabilities To Undermine Them

Trafficking, prostitution and interwoven issues of human rights have evoked significant responses from contemporary social work and feminist research trends. However, it is often ignored that when human trafficking takes place, victimization occurs at multiple familial, social, and inter-generational levels. Limited attention is paid to children of trafficked women who are equally open to facing unique stigma and discrimination as a result of their mother’s profession. These children become victims of their circumstances from birth and are often absorbed into the family trade of commercial sex-work.

This research article looks into macro and micro level vulnerabilities faced by children of sex-workers; alienating them from mainstream education, health and protection services. On one hand, prenatal and postnatal exposure to unfavorable environment is researched to result in a range of adverse outcomes for these children, including physical, psychological, social and emotional development delays to trauma, neglect, abuse, and displacement. On the other hand, these undesirable conditions also reveal space systematic social work interventions in home, community, civil society and policy spheres.

Contextualizing Vulnerabilities

Prostitution, varying from its ancient cultural and religious beginnings, is researched to be one of the oldest professions in the world (Garg, 2017). In contemporary times, prostitution and trafficking have emerged as organized forms of businesses across the globe. They thrive as structured systems of exploitation of young girls, women and children and result in methodical commercialization of flesh trade.

Over the years, prostitution as a profession has taken up several forms and manifestations including street prostitution, individual escort services and community based prostitution, which is executed in brothels and red light areas. Catalytic facilitation of prostitution is associated with various dehumanizing activities like soliciting, pimping, trafficking, procuring, and brothel keeping. There are multiple stakeholders involved in commercial sex trade; ranging from pimps, landlords/landladies, touts, customers, money-lenders and CSWs themselves (Bullough & Bullough,1987). In this feudal categorization, it is the

Figure 1: Contextualizing Vulnerabilities of Children of CSWs
sex worker who falls lowest in hierarchy and is subjected to multi-faceted exploitation.

Prostitution and interwoven issues of human rights has evoked significant responses from contemporary social work and feminist research trends (Patkar, 2013). However, it is often ignored that when human trafficking takes place, victimization occurs at multiple familial, social, and inter-generational levels. A majority of anti-trafficking interventions fail to address human rights issues pertaining to ‘children of CSWs.’

As illustrated in Figure 1, children of women in prostitution emerge as an indispensable part of this exploitative contextual framework. They reside in areas of sex industry like brothels with their mothers, grow up in an unhealthy and unsafe environment and remain at high risk of discrimination, abuse, violence and neglect.

Children of Commercial Sex Workers: Identifying Vulnerabilities

A large number of CSWs have children of their own or even seek to adopt other children (Ling, 2001). It needs to be understood here that despite her profession, the sex worker is a woman and has a natural desire and natural and positive right to bear a child. In her position of extreme social condemnation and rejection, her child alone is her hope for an alternative future, source of human relationship and sane survival (Patkar, 2013).

However, these children of CSWs are open to facing unique stigma and discrimination as a result of their mother’s profession. As depicted in Figure 2, they face layers of macro and micro level vulnerabilities, which alienates them from mainstream education, health and protection services (Sircar & Dutta, 2011).

1. Inadequate living conditions and patterns

Besides being born with the stigma of illegitimacy, children of CSWs grow up in areas of commercial sex work, where pimps, brothel keepers, clients and other anti-social elements have a direct impact on the children's upbringing.

These children live in small dingy, ill-ventilated rooms, lacking proper toilet facilities and water supply (Karandikar, Gezinski, & Meshelemiah, 2013). They often move around in unsanitary, congested and crowded bye lanes of the area and do not have an quiet and clean space to sleep, rest, study, or to cook and eat healthy food. Since these areas come alive primarily during night time and their mothers work until the wee hours of night, the children do not often have the comfort of following a stable daily routine of sleeping and studying at healthy timings.

2. Limited access to education

A majority of the mothers who are CSWs are themselves victims of illiteracy and dropping out of school. They, hence, have their own limitations in supporting and understanding the demands of their children's schooling and education. A study conducted with a sample of 600 children of CSWs, it was found out than more than 25% ‘opted’ to not attend school (Pandey, 2010).

There are various reasons why these children do have access to adequate educational opportunities. These may include not having a good school in their neighborhood, not having needed resources, time and space to study, lack of parental support to foster educational habits, facing stigma and bullying at school due to their mother’s profession.

3. No legitimate opportunities to ‘play’

While the mothers are busy with their clients, children of CSWs have few opportunities for legitimate play. They are often busy in...
helping with household chores, taking care of siblings, and even entertaining and serving refreshments for clients. Consequently they become onlookers and participants in unsavory adult activities, including dancing in shops for customers, consensual sexual acts, gambling, drinking and taking drugs. They often start becoming targets of commercial sex work themselves.

4. High health risks
Children living in brothels, in unhygienic and contaminated households, are often at high risk of catching diseases. Sexually transmitted infections (including HIV/AIDS) are a major health risk for children with parents who have multiple partners. Awareness of the health hazards might be present among CSWs, but many clients are unwilling to use condoms. These children are also often vulnerable to addiction and widespread use of tobacco, alcohol, opium and other addictive substances (Ling, 2001).

5. High instances of child sexual abuse
Being born and brought up in brothels, children of CSWs, especially young girls often learn to relate to others, gain approval and attention by using their sexuality, which can increase their vulnerability to sexual exploitation (Ling, 2001). They see their mothers, aunts and sisters as role-models and seek to themselves follow them into sex work. Most have their first sexual experience by the age of eight or nine, even before gaining puberty.

6. Skewed understanding of family roles and moral values
Children of CSWs are at a higher risk of developing skewed and ambiguous perception of family roles and responsibilities. A stable and nurturing father figure is mostly missing in the lives of these children. Within a patriarchal set-up, their mothers often are seen as subjects of societal condemnation and disapproval. They also witness their mothers being beaten, and humiliated by clients, pimps, brothel owners, and the police.

Exposure to such distorted value systems from birth leads to psychological conception of unorthodox morality, in which commercial sex work, violence and victimization of women is normalized in day-to-day life.

7. Lack of future opportunities
Children of CSWs know they are not accepted by society and are subjected to a sense of insecurity and shame about their birth and family. Stigma and societal marginalization results in lack of future job prospects. Young girl children become prone to becoming CSWs themselves. Young boys, on the other hand, become involved in the sex trade, either directly as pimps and trafficking agents, or indirectly by working in local clubs, selling drugs or alcohol. Even if these children do not get involved in commercial sex work, they lack skills, qualifications and social and economic capital to secure formal sector jobs.

Figure 3: Stakeholders for Social Work Interventions
Children of Commercial Sex Workers: Responding to Vulnerabilities

Social work response to these multiple vulnerabilities faced by children of CSWs also needs to be holistic in nature. Instead of just working with the children in isolation, vulnerabilities should be addressed by intervening differently with different inter-related stakeholders and social structures, as represented in Figure 3.

1. Parents/Mothers

- Rescue, Rehabilitation and Reintegration – A comprehensive process of well-planned rescue/raid, integrated rehabilitation on all fronts and then a systematic procedure of social reintegration can be carried out with the commercial sex worker. This can have a direct positive impact in the living conditions, household and quality of life of their children.

- Awareness and Consciousness Development – The CSWs need to be seen as conscious decision makers of their own lives and body. They should be well-informed about the consequences and responsibilities of having a child.

  ✓ As preventive mode of intervention, they can be made aware of safe contraceptives and birth control options to avoid birth of unwanted children or of children who might be prone to being born as HIV positive, or who might not get the required care and nurturing.

  ✓ As protective mode of intervention, once children are born, awareness and consciousness raising among parents need to take place about significance of child-education, proper health care, mandatory protection from abuse and neglect, and opportunity to grow into socially responsible adults.

- Education and Skill Development – Adult literacy and vocational training opportunities need to be made available for CSWs. This can open doors for alternate employment and livelihood options for them and their children.

2. Community

Residing in an area of sex-industry and being an on-looker to illicit activities, which occur in this ‘community’, can be detrimental for the children and can lead to child labor and child prostitution.

- Relocation to an alternate community - The first option should be to relocate the child from an unsafe and unhealthy surrounding and find alternate, more conducive living arrangements, foster care, institutionalization, or alternate housing for mother and child.

- Creating alternates within the community - If alternates available outside the community cannot be accessed, separate ‘safe spaces’ for children can be created within the community itself. These spaces should be easily accessible, free of cost and constructive for the child’s development. These can include night care centers, day care/drop in centers, play areas, youth vocational training centers etc.

- Community sensitization workshops – and programs about issues of child rights, well-being and protection need to be regularly raised at a larger spectrum. There can be a ‘Community Watchdog Committee’ consisting of responsible members of the area to ensure that no child is involved in unfavorable activities on the street or elsewhere.

3. Government/Civil Society Organizations

Long term changes in the in the lives of this section of children can be initiated through a combination of governmental and civil society intervention.

- Recognition of vulnerabilities – The rights of children of CSWs and their vulnerabilities are often ignored in overall government schemes and policies for children. Hence it is important to decrease invisibilities of this section of child population and bring their needs to the forefront.

- Minimization of vulnerabilities – Additional rights-based services can be implemented through civil society initiatives in terms of health, education, protection, development and participation of these children.

CSWs are often not seen as ‘mothers/parents’, exposing their children to multi-layered vulnerabilities. This article puts forward how prenatal and postnatal exposure to unfavorable environment can result in a range of adverse outcomes for these children, including physical, psychological, social and emotional development delays to trauma, neglect, abuse, and displacement. On the other hand, these undesirable conditions also reveal space for systematic social work interventions in home, community, civil society and policy spheres.

References:
Human trafficking is a widespread phenomenon in the world. It involves the use of force, or coercion to obtain some type of labor or commercial sex act and is often called "modern-slavery. It includes labor trafficking, such as hotel or farm labor, domestic servitude, and sex trafficking. This continues to be a key problem, both nationally and internationally. The co-morbidity of communicable and non-communicable diseases along with mental health issues among trafficked individuals make addressing human trafficking an urgent task. The existence of human trafficking is a result of greater societal problems which include childhood abuse and neglect, poverty, illiterate, homelessness etc. Social workers are taking the lead in efforts to reduce the number of human trafficking victims and help keep young people from falling prey to traffickers through awareness and intervention strategies.

Context
According to the Trafficking in Persons Report (TIP) (2011), over the last 15 years the term human trafficking has been used to describe the activities involved when one person obtains or holds another person in compelled service. Trafficking provides an endless supply of human beings for use in every possible labor industry. This global problem affects every nation in the world, with the most vulnerable members of society being targeted as victims of trafficking. Many have been made vulnerable by poverty and conflict. Globalization and transnational migration trends continue to amplify economic disparities and increase the vulnerability of oppressed populations to different forms of human trafficking. Most victims of human trafficking are generally exploited for labor or sexual purposes.

Population at risk
All children under age 18 engaged in commercial sex acts are considered victims of trafficking. Smaller proportions are victims of organ removal or unethical adoption processes (Roby & Bergquist, 2014). Persons most vulnerable to human trafficking are the poor, marginalized, and the individuals seeking employment opportunities. Majority of human trafficking victims today are women and girls (United States Department of State, 2013). The feminization of poverty and gender-biased cultural norms that encourage the subjugation of women increase their vulnerability to human trafficking. Political activists and popular media have mostly focused on the sex trafficking of women and children (Alvarez & Alessi, 2012). Due to this narrow lens regarding human trafficking, men trafficked for labor are often overlooked and may not receive support (Alvarez & Alessi, 2012).

Prevalence of human trafficking
Worldwide, approximately 5.5 million victims of human trafficking are under the age of 18 (International Labour Office, 2013). Approximately 1.2 million children are trafficked annually worldwide (Blumhofer, Shah, Grodin, & Crosby, 2011). The United Nations on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) noted a general trend of increased child trafficking throughout the world, which was most prevalent in Africa (UNODC, 2012). Children who are refugees or internally displaced are vulnerable to trafficking (United States Department of State, 2013). The process of constant movement is another reason trafficking prevalence is so difficult to accurately assess. The main transit regions include Eastern Europe, Asia, Africa, the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) (an alliance of former Soviet Republics), and the industrialized nations. Finally, the primary destination countries are Italy, the United States, Germany, the Netherlands, Japan, Greece, Turkey, and Thailand (Hodge & Lietz, 2007).

Mental health issues and trauma in victims of human trafficking
Common among all oppressors, whether controlling prisoners of war, intimates in domestic violence, or human trafficking, is their systematic, repetitive infliction of psychological trauma that is initially enforced with physical violence. Violence can take many forms such as hitting, grabbing and controlling or contorting the body, punching,
stabbing, torture, destruction of personal property, pets, or harm to others, rape, beatings, being burned with whatever is available, or being cut and having salt poured into the wounds (Hodge & Lietz, 2007). Violence is used because it convinces the victim that the perpetrator is omnipotent and that resistance is futile, even dangerous (Aron, 2006).

After initial assault, merely the threat of harm to self or others is sufficient. However, control is amplified through other systematic means. Trauma and the terror of further pain is heightened by compromising the victim’s physiological system, through long periods of sleep deprivation and forced use of alcohol and other drugs, through physical restraint such as chaining or locking up, and having food withheld (Shigekane, 2007). Thus through violence, intermittent reward, isolation, and enforced dependency, a trafficker creates a submissive and compliant prisoner. However, the final step in the psychological control of the victim is not completed until she has been forced to violate her own moral principles and to betray basic human attachments. Shame and embarrassment are the legacy of most victim survivors (Aron, 2006).

Psychologically speaking, the most compelling and destructive of all coercive techniques is when a victim comes to loathe herself. When the victim under duress participates in the sacrifice of others, she is truly broken, once they have achieved this, the trafficker has complete control.

Even though survivors may eventually be free from physical control of their captors, the mental health problems from their terror and experience continue to create a prison of fear. Most common is post-traumatic stress disorder, accompanying suicidal ideation, almost always serious depression, underlined with anxiety and chronic fear (Barrows & Finger, 2008). Additionally mental health symptoms may also include or create co-morbid conditions from substance and alcohol abuse and dissociative disorders (Erin, 2009). The mental health disorders of human trafficking victims may be similar to those that have lived in an active war zone or experienced torture (Williamson, Dutch, & Clawson, 2008). These health consequences indicate the life-altering cost to victims of human trafficking.

Along with manifestations of mental health symptoms are physical health issues as well although systematic documentation of specific health problems is lacking (Barrows & Finger, 2008). The following are some examples of general health issues: Infectious diseases such as human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) and AIDS; Noninfectious diseases; Heat stroke or exhaustion; Cancer; Musculoskeletal trauma from awkward posture. It’s reported that victims are often forced to endure severe violence on a regular basis.

Case scenarios of victims of human trafficking (live interview)
I was taken from Nigeria to Italy, after some months I was able to escape and here is my story of pain and agony, I was taken to Italy for prostitution, my mistress told me that I must prostitute to pay her 65,000 euro, which is the money I am expected to pay her before I can be free.

I was a victim of human trafficking that was brought
back home by NAPTIP (National Agency for Prohibition of Trafficking in Persons). I left Nigeria to go to Libya. I was taken to Agadez then, to be taken to Libya. We were 160 and like sardines in a boat, the boat capsized and only four of us survived. The road is very risky, nobody should venture on such journey (96.9 Speed FM Benin City).

Social Work role

To assist victims of human trafficking along the path to recovery multidisciplinary efforts are required. Social workers can play an important role in many of the victims’ efforts to recover from the trauma of trafficking and to have a better life. Since Social Workers are trained to work in a variety of settings including but not limited to inpatient mental health facilities, community mental health centers, psychiatric hospitals etc. Approaches that can be used by social workers in their work with victims of human trafficking include: intervention in crises, psychological support, assistance with state authorities, assistance finding the appropriate accommodation, accompanying in the judicial processes, counseling services for the returnees, information and training, information and counseling for family members. Social workers should be involved in prevention programming to minimize the risk factors that increase the probability of trafficking activity.

Preventive measures

• Eradicating human trafficking begins with fulfilling the needs of less privilege worldwide.
• The family sector should be assisted through micro-credit, education, health prevention etc
• Creating awareness among vulnerable populations is another key to the prevention of human trafficking.
• Faith-based communities can also assist in educating their members about the prevalence and the prevention of human trafficking.

Services to victims of human trafficking

The practice of social workers with clients can be divided into three different levels: micro, mezzo, and macro.

Micro level is the most common practice and happens directly with an individual client or family to deal with their problems. It includes: helping individuals to find appropriate housing, health care, and social services; family therapy and individual counseling; treatment of people suffering from a mental health condition or substance abuse problem.

Mezzo level happens on an intermediate scale, involving neighborhoods, institutions or other smaller groups. Social workers can work together with non governmental agencies (NGO) in rehabilitating of victims of human trafficking.

Macro level is interventions that can be provided on a large scale that affects entire communities and systems of care. Examples include lobbying to change a law, organizing a state-wide activist group or advocating for large-scale social policy change. Macro social work practice empowers human trafficking victims by involving them in systemic change. Social workers and health professionals can advocate for legislation that gives stiffer penalties to traffickers and purchasers of sex.

Conclusion

It is essential to address the factors responsible for human trafficking for example childhood abuse and neglect, poverty, lack of educational opportunity, addiction, mental illness, homelessness and war. Creating policies which address the societal conditions that support global labor exploitation in all its forms. Human traffickers should also be arrested and prosecuted.

References


Human Trafficking and Forced Labour in Uzbekistan

From the human trafficking perspective, global capitalism has divided the world into three categories: suppliers, receivers, and regions of both. As with most Asian countries, Uzbekistan belongs to the first category. Although its forced labour in cotton harvesting is quite well known, much less is known of the poverty driving many Uzbekistanis into work migration and forced labour. The authors, researchers from economically ‘rich’ nations, had the rare opportunity to conduct scientific interviews in Uzbekistan with persons in different positions and occupations, including victims of forced labour and social workers in NGOs. The interviews describe processes and elements typical of forced labour relations, while reflecting the structural dependencies inherent in global capitalism. Although some social workers pursue only governmental interests, others rescue victims, support them comprehensively, and initiate structural changes. They deserve support in demanding fair migration and trading laws, spreading information, raising funds, changing consumer attitudes, and reducing discrimination.

Theoretical Framework

Throughout the world, an estimated 40 million persons live in forced labour (ILO, 2016). According to the UN’s ‘Convention against Transnational Organized Crime’, a human trafficking victim’s consent is irrelevant if the person is recruited by fraud, deception, etc. As Paz-Fuchs (2016) emphasizes, often, victims are not free to terminate employment relationships. In the ILO’s Abolition of Forced Labour Convention (1957) economic dependence is not considered (Ollus, 2015:230); nonetheless, the ‘background conditions’ ‘driving’ individuals to enter conditions of servitude, forced labour or slavery’ are important (Paz-Fuchs 2016:773). This calls attention to the interests and profitable circumstances of the exploiters as well (Crane, 2013).
Little is known in Western countries about Central Asian states after breaking up of the Soviet Union. In Uzbekistan, living conditions worsened tremendously. The cotton-based economy declined, and the industry collapsed owing to lack of technical knowledge and skilled workers. A few elites profit from unemployment, underemployment, and poverty due to low wages and forced labour. Governmental efforts to reduce forced labour are impeded by factors inherent in global capitalism, forcing poor persons to accept any income-promising work either within or outside the country.

Methodology
In addition to analysis of the structural preconditions of forced labour, it is indispensable to listen to the voices of victims to perceive what social workers do, what their limitations are, and how they could improve their contribution to reduce human trafficking and forced labour.

Based on semi-structured interviews with social workers, other professionals, and trafficking and forced labour victims in Uzbekistan in 2017, this article focuses on empirical data to enhance scientific knowledge about concrete features in a rather inaccessible field. From more than ten interviews, three were selected to be presented here. Although similar cases are frequent, the interviews do not claim to be representative. For the informants’ safety, details of the settings are omitted.

Case Studies
Victim X:
X is a disabled middle-aged man whose impairment makes it impossible for him to support himself in Uzbekistan. Since he was told he could earn much higher wages in Russia and his brother had indeed succeeded there, X left for Russia when a Korean man offered to accompany him. When he began working as a shepherd, his passport was taken for registration—but it was never returned. After about five months without payment, one day, when X was tending to the cows as his boss had ordered him, the boss’s van burnt down. X suspected the boss had started the fire to force X to stay for many years as he would not have been able to raise the amount the boss demanded for the van. X fought with the boss about the liability for the lost van. He left gladly when three other workers looking for another workplace jointly offered to help X.

The new boss, referring to the missing passport, did not pay either. X realized that he had been deceived again. Despite his desperate situation, he could not expect any support from the police—he could be arrested for staying in Russia without a passport, have to offer bribes, or be taken to another deceiving boss. Therefore, X gave up earning his living himself. He phoned his sister to request help to return home without having to endure any further physical or economic damage. X’s sister turned to the Uzbek police, who had begun rescuing their countrymen who were fraudulently deprived of their passport in another country. She advised X to contact an NGO that was helping trafficked persons escape.

With the help of this NGO, X finally managed to return home and even began a small business. He now rears laying hens, selling one or two eggs a day. Still, because of lack of money, he has not yet obtained a new passport, which is a precondition for disabled people to receive financial support. Nonetheless, X feels relieved and comfortable now, staying with his sister and mother.

Victim Y:
Y is a mother of four minors. While her husband worked for five years in Russia, her father-in-law helped support the young family. However, since he passed away, Y had to look for a job herself. At that time, a neighbour’s relative was telling people about good working conditions and high salaries harvesting crop in Kazakhstan. With two other women, Y followed this seemingly attractive offer.

When they began work, however, they realized they had been deceived. Their passports were taken for ‘registration’ but not returned. The working conditions were terrible: they worked from 4 o’clock in the morning until 8 o’clock at night, receiving only thin soup and dry bread to eat and a basket of cold water to wash their face, and sleeping in an old hut on mats they had brought themselves. When they dared to ask for more, they were beaten. They did not receive any payment. After one week, Y called an NGO that supported victims of trafficking and forced labour. Her boss beat her to prevent her from talking, but one of her co-workers continued to telephone instead. The NGO could not interfere outside of Uzbekistan, but a cooperating NGO in Kazakhstan together with the Kazakhstan police helped retrieve their passports and brought them to the Uzbek border where the Uzbek NGO welcomed them and escorted them home.

Thereafter, members of the NGO taught Y and the other women how to avoid deceivers and become a victim in the future. They offer the rescued women individual advice and financial support, from professional training to starting their own business. Since Y had always liked making cookies, she chose to concentrate on this. Now, she smiles whenever she talks about her work. She runs her small business quite successfully.

Regarding the culprit, his relatives insistently begged the victims not to contact the police or an advocate, while the culprit moved to another village only to continue his dirty business there. At least ten other women are said to have become his further victims. Out of fear of exclusion from the community or revenge from their persecutor, the victims fear to talk about their experience. Their relatives would consider it a shame for the whole family and may blame rather than support the victims, accusing them of being greedy, stupid, or both.

Z (Representative of an NGO):
Besides mentioning cases like the two presented above, Z discusses terribly cruel cases of trafficking, including some resulting in the victims’ death.

According to her, in Soviet times, all people had work
and enjoyed a comprehensive social security system, but after the collapse, this changed rapidly. Russian engineers left for Western countries, and industrial machines became old and were sold instead of being repaired. Except in Tashkent, there are no significant industries any longer, and Uzbek workers often travel to Russia. This leads to organized trafficking.

Families collect money to send a member abroad for work, but the traffickers demand more than the family can afford and propose that the difference be paid from the salary earned abroad. In fact, they always search for causes to keep the victims dependent and in their custody, and whenever a victim comes close to paying off the last instalment to regain her freedom, the traffickers sell her somewhere else, sometimes using drugs to make her submissive. Very rarely are the deceivers caught, because they usually accompany those they betray to traffickers abroad. Even well-educated women have been sold into forced labour, before the NGO began its awareness campaigns.

Since 2001, Z’s NGO has educated local people about legal conditions when going abroad, advising them to trust only official job agencies and never surrender their passport. They might get a new passport issued in Kirgizia with a tourist visa to enter Russia, only to be sent further to Dubai, Israel, or Egypt where they would be forced to work as sex slaves for up to 50 ‘clients’ a day. Some of these pitiable victims commit suicide, while some others die from maltreatment. The ‘lucky’ ones among those resisting their torturers may be abandoned anywhere and told to find work themselves, but most often they are caught by the police for staying abroad without a valid visa and passport. The police may then either arrest the victim or hand her over to an NGO rescuing victims of trafficking.

In 2007, ahead of other Central Asian countries, the Uzbek parliament passed a law prohibiting human trafficking. Since then, the police’s attitude has changed from that of a secondary prosecutor to that of a supporter. Occasionally, they take victims to shelters established by the government, but the women may stay there only for ten days without any other place to go to thereafter. Besides, many victims fear the police. Nurses, who are supposed to support a victim, may let her relatives know of a blood test leading to the victim’s expulsion from her family.

The traffickers and their partners, on the other hand, have become more circumspect since the new law was passed and still tend to remain one step ahead of the police. They now sell men more often than before, forcing them into cruel hard work and intimidating them through torture.

To reduce trafficking in Uzbekistan, Z considers the establishment of official rules for work migration unavoidable; however, such rules would require the government to acknowledge the shortage of jobs inside the country instead of stigmatizing those leaving for work abroad as ‘idlers’. An agreement concerning work migration exists only with Korea, but even this cannot guarantee migrants’ safety. They are vulnerable, whether they leave or stay, as they are exposed to local trafficking and forced labour without contracts and insurance and to extremely low, irregular payment both within Uzbekistan and abroad. Even teachers do not receive salary regularly and frequently have to migrate because of continuous recurring costs, leading to rising debts and making it inevitable for them to change their workplace.

Analysis

The search for reliable income divides families and forces individuals to undertake risky travels. The law of registration offers bosses a chance to establish dependence. Although acquaintances, companions, and public servants can all be helpful, they can also be dangerous. Although supportive on the surface, even local and familial communities prove to be unreliable. The same might apply to social workers employed in a government-organized NGO. Nonetheless, some social workers show a high degree of commitment in not only rescuing victims of trafficking but also supporting them to become independent. They also educate village folk about the risks and precautions of work migration, as well as assist the police in recognizing victims and raising their awareness of secondary damage. They courageously oppose political pressure with demands and intensified activism.

Conclusion

Although the new government has introduced changes, many Uzbekistanis still cannot help but become migrant workers, notwithstanding the risks involved. The response of social workers varies, from ignorance to rescue measures and active involvement in bringing about structural improvements. Despite political pressure and the risk of being arrested, maybe even tortured, their courageous response earns our support and admiration.

These social workers and victims deserve international support through pressure on companies and governments for fair trade, legally improved and controlled work conditions, and reliable migration laws. They need financial support for start-ups, investments to create jobs, and educational improvements, including vocational training. Almost everybody could be of help by spreading information and raising consumer awareness. Cooperation offers from foreign colleagues could help them as well.

References


Why the high figures of sex-work migrants in Edo State, Nigeria? Considerations for social work practice

Amidst interventions poised to curb sex-work migration and human trafficking in Edo State of Nigeria, figures are still on the high side. The roles played by certain factors seem not to have been effectively integrated into these interventions. The general inadequacy of social work expertise contributes in no little amount to the underachievement of existing interventions. The article underscores these factors in 5 typologies, while arguing the importance of social work to the entire remedial process. Scientifically, it borrows ideas from the Capability Approach to make causal explanations, while relying on reviews of relevant literature for knowledge.

Context

Nigeria accounts for top contributions to international sex-work (National Commission for Refugees, Migrants and Internally Displaced Persons [NCFRMI], 2017), with trafficking of women a major channel (International Organization for Migration [IOM], 2018). The figure of sex-work migrants in Italy alone, is put at 11,009 persons as at 2016, which is an increase from 439 in 2013. Edo State in Nigeria, among the country’s 37 federating units, accounts for most prevalent occurrences of trafficking vis-à-vis sex-work migration. Odorige (2016) claims that 85% of Nigerian sex-workers in Europe originated or migrated from Edo State. IOM (2018) puts the figure at over 60%.

Allowing the twin practice of sex-work migration and trafficking of women to thrive in Edo state are couple of factors spread across categories of cultural, economic, educational, globalization, and political concerns. Key cultural factors reported across literature that foster sex-work migration among residents of Edo state include the widespread of voodoo practice, normalization of migration, large family size, and patriarchy. In Onyeji (2018) and Osezua (2016), voodoo practice is used for sealing bonds between victims of sex-work migration and their principals (madams), and/or cast them under ‘spell’ to yield unquestionably to the process. Also, sex-work migration was revealed by Monde-Anumihe (2013) as increasingly becoming a norm in the area, enjoying support from nuclear and extended families. Additionally, reproductive lifestyle obtainable in the area, which amounts to so many children not having similar parents, makes parenting difficult, and deepens vulnerability to human trafficking and deceptions to travel abroad (Oyekanmi & Okunola, 2017). Lastly, feminization of poverty in the area, has created a perspective where females see this kind of migration as an avenue to make wealth (Osezua, 2016). Given that the male folks by tradition are exclusively in possession of lands and viable economic means for survival.

Economic factors likewise stimulate sex-work migration. Burgio (2017) made mention of poverty, unemployment, and debt-bonds (a financial agreement involving victims owing their principals a sum usually spent on their travel, or an agreed fee to pay for the opportunity of travelling) as key to sustaining the occupation. Home Office (2016) of the UK Government highlighted the strong role made by material remittances of successful migrants as a major influencer. The respect the successful ones enjoy at home, and the desire to be placed in such shoes of bringing back material remittances stimulate the urge to travel, and makes the occupation an appealing one.

Further, ignorance over the scourge of human trafficking, migration policies of countries, acceptable travelling standards, and what it takes to live in a foreign country, makes for the prevalence of sex-work migration in Edo state (Iyanda & Nwogwugwu, 2016; Dagaci, 2016). The images of migrants on social media stimulates the urge and quest to migrate (Ibrahim & Mukhtar, 2016), sometimes, heedless of the appalling circumstances involved. Adding to the consequence of social media – a channel for globalization, is the high demand across Europe for sex-work migrants of African descent (Alexander, 2014), and richness of the international sex-work market – about $100b generated annually (Gungul & Audu, 2014).

Finally, the political influence on the issue of sex-work migration and human trafficking range from: politically induced ecological tragedy of Edo state just like all other Niger Delta states, thereby amounting to poor human development index (Odorige, 2016); others include, political covering of human traffickers, and
corrupt immigration personnel profiting from the occupation (Dauda & Muhamadu, 2016). These account for perversion of justice, thereby further weakening remedial efforts.

**Appraising existing interventions**

Several interventions to curb trafficking of women vis-à-vis sex-work migration exist in Nigeria. The establishment of the National Agency for the Prohibition of Trafficking in Persons (NAPTIP) in 2003 is one. The agency is commissioned by law to investigate, research, collaborate with relevant security and non-governmental agencies, and to prosecute human traffickers (Osezua, 2016). They also pay attention to the psychosocial wellbeing of victims, through sensitizing the public on human trafficking, providing shelters and relief items to victims, and also interface with witch doctors used in mystifying human trafficking processes (Onyeji, 2018). Further, the Edo state government signed a ‘state-base’ trafficking prohibition law in May 2018, which adds up to efforts they make in rehabilitating and reintegrating victims through stipends and small scale businesses (Aliu, 2018).

There is dearth of literature appraising the effectiveness of these interventions. However, it is suggestive that the steady increase in figures of sex-work migrants (NCFRMI, 2017) implies scaling up interventions. Very importantly, the unaddressed push factors deepening the vulnerability of these females and making them susceptible to trafficking and sex-work migration are yet to be tackled. Issues of political instability, poor economy, and poor educational opportunities persist in Nigeria (IOM, 2018). Lastly, the issue of corruption among immigration officials, and the political protection some traffickers enjoy frustrate interventions, especially in terms of apprehension and prosecution (Oyekanmi & Okunola, 2017). Therefore, there is still lot to do if the twin cases of sex-work migration and trafficking of women must be a thing of the past. It is in this vein that the profession of social work becomes of critical importance to the entire remedial process.

**Social work concerns and sex-work migration**

The profession of social work is known for its knowledge and skills in advocacy, counselling, social action, empowerment, resource linkage/mobilization, mental health, social protection, social care, and inter-sectoral/multi-disciplinary collaboration (Okoye, 2013). The importance of bringing these varieties of social work interventions to the process of trafficking of women and sex-work migration cannot be overstated. These interventions can come at the macro, mezzo and micro levels, and are encouraged to be more preventive than curative.

At macro level better legislations and policies that deter traffickers and their accomplices, as well as those that foster socioeconomic protection are recommended (Braimah, 2013; Odorige, 2016). The more educated and economically viable one is, the chances of being susceptible to traffickers and sex-work migration lessens. The need to promote girl-child
education, among other rights for the female gender should be encouraged by social workers. This inspired the recommendation by Odorige (2016) to have social workers in primary, secondary and tertiary schools, so they could help in addressing social and emotional needs of females using counselling and group therapies. Adding to this is paying attention to cultural gaps that push them toward sex-work migration. Media and community based sensitization would be of help, and where necessary, social action through rallies, road-walks, among others. The aim is to have everyone aware of this scourge, and the need to stay away from it.

Further, the influence of voodoo on the process is mentioned to be traumatizing and made to instill fear in the minds of victims (Ikeora, 2016). The impact of this is that it makes legal redress difficult, given that victims have been made to swear to secrecy, and where broken, could meet unappealing situations like death or mental illness (Ikeora, 2016; Onyeji, 2018). So it affects the abilities of victims to live meaningfully. Thus, social workers could work together with clinical psychologists to help with desensitization (Edwards & Mika, 2017). Stronger partnerships with the witch doctors is advised in Onyeji (2018). He revealed that most times these witch doctors are oblivious of the actual realities trafficked victims face abroad. So, they could reverse the spell, refuse their charms for such purpose, and help in advancing campaigns against human trafficking and sex-work migration. In addition, social workers could organize harm reduction programmes and services to help reintegrate victims. This they could achieve together with NGOs and high profile persons in the society. The need for housing assistance, medical care, security, and Sexually Transmitted Diseases (STDs) prevention is important to prevent victims from the dangers of re-trafficking (Braimah, 2013).

Conclusion
This article began by establishing facts of the prevalence of sex-work migration involving females in Edo state, and the contributions of human trafficking to the figures. It went further to discuss factors responsible for the increase in typologies of cultural, economic, educational, globalization, and political factors. It argues that these factors should have to be addressed, as they clamp on capabilities to effectively resist human traffickers’ deceptions, and urge to migrate for sex-work. This is supported by Martha Nussbaum and Amartya Sen’s Capability Approach of the 1980s. They argued that to make life meaningful for people, certain capabilities like education, political stability, economic viability, environmental protection, etc., must be in place (Clark, 2002). Their absence would cause people to go in search of them, not minding circumstances that ensue. Thereby, making human trafficking and sex-work migration, means to get back these capabilities they cannot find in their countries of origin. This is where the need for social workers becomes crucial as discussed.

References
Human trafficking as a global illegal and unethical business practice: an overview of the phenomenon and the role of social work in Greece

Human trafficking is a global social justice problem that has negative impact on the lives of the poorest and most vulnerable people. Undoubtedly, it is a crime against humanity and an unethical and illegal business practice. In Greece, like other countries, human trafficking is considered as a complex and multifaceted phenomenon in which social workers are at the forefront of efforts to tackle its consequences for the victims. This article briefly describes the current situation of human trafficking in Greece as a destination and transit country in the EU and then analyses the role of Greek social workers to address this social problem. Finally, it makes specific suggestions for reforms and improvements to deal with the trafficking of human beings in the country.

Overview of human trafficking

Human trafficking is an unethical crime against humanity and one of the fastest growing criminal businesses globally. It is considered the modern form of slavery and has become a dangerous global phenomenon threatening the human dignity and life of the poorest and most vulnerable. It is estimated that 24.9 million men, women and children are victims of human trafficking around the globe, while the majority of trafficking victims are women and girls (ILO, 2017). Human trafficking is defined in the UN (2000) Trafficking in Persons Protocol as involving three steps a) Recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons; b) By means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability, or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person; and c) With the intent of exploiting that person through: prostitution of others, sexual exploitation, forced labour, slavery (or similar practices), servitude, and removal of organs.

Human trafficking is a complicated phenomenon. Research from around the globe has shown that different factors are responsible for the trafficking in human beings. But the most common causal factors of human trafficking can be categorised into ‘push’ and ‘pull’ factors. Push factors can include poverty, unemployment, gender inequalities, armed conflict and violence and the lack of social security. Instead, pull factors can include job opportunities, the prospect of better living and better living conditions, demand for cheap and unskilled labour, as well as provision of sexual services, organs and tissues. Victimisation and exploitation are often the results of the combination of the above factors. According to the United Nations, the most common forms of human trafficking are trafficking for sexual exploitation and forced labour.

Human trafficking in Greece

Greece is one of the destination and transit countries in the EU and to a lesser extent, a source country for human trafficking. Due to the wars and refugee crisis, Greece has also become one of the main entry points for migration in Europe. As a result, potential victims of trafficking may be identified amongst the undocumented migrants and refugees entering the country. A new study estimates that 89,000 people live in modern slavery in Greece (Global Slavery Index, 2018) due to its geographical position that offers smugglers a lucrative ground for their illegal activities to thrive. Trafficking for forced labour and sex exploitation are the most common forms of human trafficking in Greece, although forced labour is less frequently detected and reported than trafficking for sexual exploitation due to the lack of accurate statistics.
Victims of forced labour are primarily children and men from Eastern Europe, South Asia, and Africa. Migrant workers who come from impoverished countries (Bangladesh, Pakistan, and Afghanistan) are susceptible to debt bondage, reportedly in agriculture cleaning services, tourism and food/beverages production (GRETA, 2017; U.S. Embassy in Greece, 2018). Economically marginalized Roma children from Albania, Bulgaria and Romania are forced to sell goods on the street, beg or commit petty theft (GRETA, 2017). The underage victims who are forced to beg are usually boys 12 to 18 years old, whereas we sometimes encounter younger ages (Ketekidou, 2014). Finally, the rise of unaccompanied child migrants in Greece has also increased their vulnerability to trafficking and exploitation.

As far as sex exploitation is concerned, women and girls from different countries (e.g. Bulgaria, Romania, Russia, China and Nigeria) form the vast majority of human trafficking victims. In particular, women are subjected to sex trafficking in strip clubs, in massage salons, in unlicensed brothels, on the street and in hotels (U.S. Embassy in Greece, 2018). Out of the crimes that are reported to the authorities, sex trafficking remains the dominant form of human exploitation in Greece followed by forced begging (Hellenic Police, Security Division, Public Security Direction, Crime Analysis Unit, 2018). Trafficking children from Balkan countries to Greece including Roma children begging in the streets are at particularly high risk of being forced into prostitution by traffickers (Anagnostou & Kandyla, 2015).

Addressing human trafficking

Over the years, Greece has made significant progress in improving its legislative, administrative and judicial mechanisms to combat human trafficking. By the Law 3875/2010 and the Directive 2011/36/EU on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings, Greece has harmonized its legislation with that existing in the EU and has complied with the international conventions on human trafficking (Miha, 2014). Today, there are two police anti-trafficking units to monitor and combat trafficking in persons that work in cooperation with government agencies and NGO’s. Interagency collaboration has become a highly regarded way to address human trafficking in the country and as such, more and more government agencies, NGOs and local support networks in recent years, have undertaken joint initiatives to address human trafficking issues at all levels of public intervention, from prevention and treatment to recovery.

As far as sex exploitation is concerned, women and girls from different countries (e.g. Bulgaria, Romania, Russia, China and Nigeria) form the vast majority of human trafficking victims. In particular, women are subjected to sex trafficking in strip clubs, in massage salons, in unlicensed brothels, on the street and in hotels (U.S. Embassy in Greece, 2018). Out of the crimes that are reported to the authorities, sex trafficking remains the dominant form of human exploitation in Greece followed by forced begging (Hellenic Police, Security Division, Public Security Direction, Crime Analysis Unit, 2018). Trafficking children from Balkan countries to Greece including Roma children begging in the streets are at particularly high risk of being forced into prostitution by traffickers (Anagnostou & Kandyla, 2015).

Addressing human trafficking

Over the years, Greece has made significant progress in improving its legislative, administrative and judicial mechanisms to combat human trafficking. By the Law 3875/2010 and the Directive 2011/36/EU on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings, Greece has harmonized its legislation with that existing in the EU and has complied with the international conventions on human trafficking (Miha, 2014). Today, there are two police anti-trafficking units to monitor and combat trafficking in persons that work in cooperation with government agencies and NGO’s. Interagency collaboration has become a highly regarded way to address human trafficking in the country and as such, more and more government agencies, NGOs and local support networks in recent years, have undertaken joint initiatives to address human trafficking issues at all levels of public intervention, from prevention and treatment to recovery.

Addressing human trafficking

Over the years, Greece has made significant progress in improving its legislative, administrative and judicial mechanisms to combat human trafficking. By the Law 3875/2010 and the Directive 2011/36/EU on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings, Greece has harmonized its legislation with that existing in the EU and has complied with the international conventions on human trafficking (Miha, 2014). Today, there are two police anti-trafficking units to monitor and combat trafficking in persons that work in cooperation with government agencies and NGO’s. Interagency collaboration has become a highly regarded way to address human trafficking in the country and as such, more and more government agencies, NGOs and local support networks in recent years, have undertaken joint initiatives to address human trafficking issues at all levels of public intervention, from prevention and treatment to recovery.

Addressing human trafficking

Over the years, Greece has made significant progress in improving its legislative, administrative and judicial mechanisms to combat human trafficking. By the Law 3875/2010 and the Directive 2011/36/EU on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings, Greece has harmonized its legislation with that existing in the EU and has complied with the international conventions on human trafficking (Miha, 2014). Today, there are two police anti-trafficking units to monitor and combat trafficking in persons that work in cooperation with government agencies and NGO’s. Interagency collaboration has become a highly regarded way to address human trafficking in the country and as such, more and more government agencies, NGOs and local support networks in recent years, have undertaken joint initiatives to address human trafficking issues at all levels of public intervention, from prevention and treatment to recovery.

Addressing human trafficking

Over the years, Greece has made significant progress in improving its legislative, administrative and judicial mechanisms to combat human trafficking. By the Law 3875/2010 and the Directive 2011/36/EU on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings, Greece has harmonized its legislation with that existing in the EU and has complied with the international conventions on human trafficking (Miha, 2014). Today, there are two police anti-trafficking units to monitor and combat trafficking in persons that work in cooperation with government agencies and NGO’s. Interagency collaboration has become a highly regarded way to address human trafficking in the country and as such, more and more government agencies, NGOs and local support networks in recent years, have undertaken joint initiatives to address human trafficking issues at all levels of public intervention, from prevention and treatment to recovery.

Addressing human trafficking

Over the years, Greece has made significant progress in improving its legislative, administrative and judicial mechanisms to combat human trafficking. By the Law 3875/2010 and the Directive 2011/36/EU on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings, Greece has harmonized its legislation with that existing in the EU and has complied with the international conventions on human trafficking (Miha, 2014). Today, there are two police anti-trafficking units to monitor and combat trafficking in persons that work in cooperation with government agencies and NGO’s. Interagency collaboration has become a highly regarded way to address human trafficking in the country and as such, more and more government agencies, NGOs and local support networks in recent years, have undertaken joint initiatives to address human trafficking issues at all levels of public intervention, from prevention and treatment to recovery.
Overall, social workers working in all employment setting (government and NGOs sectors) play a crucial role in identifying victims and assessing their situation and needs. They also help victims to deal with the bureaucratic procedures, prepare and accompanies them to court or to health and social care services. As time proceeds, the social worker helps victims to come out of traumatic experience and regain their former independence. Finally, social workers work within an interdisciplinary team to address the multi-layered trauma experienced by trafficking victims.

In Greece, due to high rates of migrants’ inflow in recent years, victims of human trafficking may, at sometime, be detected in refugees’ camps. Thus, social workers and other professionals working with refugee and migrants need to be able to listen and build trust to identify someone in the trafficking situation. This is because, as Alvarez and Alessi (2012) note, trafficking victims initially do not show special characteristics to be distinguished from the general population. However, professionals are not always capable of recognizing a potential victim or identifying a trafficking victim, either because they are not appropriately trained to do so or because of the rush procedures and conditions of transition existing in refugee camps (U.S. Department of State, 2018).

Finally, it is important to point out, that, during the past years, several training programs have been conducted to inform front line professionals including social workers about the trafficking of adults and children in particular. Yet, most of these programs referred to personnel working on state’s services and not to those employed privately (G.R.E.T.A., 2017); many social workers working in the private sector tend to be partially unaware of the details of caring for a trafficked victim and as a result, they do not use victim-centered and trauma-informed approaches.

Conclusion and implications

The human trafficking trade is a global social justice problem that needs cooperation through partnership-based approaches and targeted interventions at all levels in order to be addressed effectively. As stated, Greece has made significant efforts to combat this problem. Despite all its efforts, further structural reforms and grounded evidence-based practice information are needed in order to eliminate the phenomenon of trafficking holistically. At the same time, rigorous research studies are required to better understand human trafficking on a local level, as well as public awareness campaigns to spread messages which educate the public to recognize it. Moreover, it is important to establish protective specialized services (e.g. shelters for male adults) for trafficking victims to avoid further marginalization and social exclusion. Furthermore, there must be adequate programs to train social workers to provide specialized services to meet the unique needs of trafficked victims, both in the public and private sector.

Given that human trafficking is a social justice problem with catastrophic outcomes for individuals and societies, the role of the social worker as human rights defenders and helpers of survivors is the key to addressing this problem. To this end, social work schools in Greece have much to offer by providing their students with the appropriate knowledge and skills to adequately prepare themselves to deal with such a serious social problem.

References


Social integration of victims of human trafficking in Bosnia and Herzegovina

Human trafficking in the context of Bosnia and Herzegovina is of a scientific, professional and social importance, and at the same time, not at all researched phenomenon. Even though human trafficking is not a new and unknown phenomenon to our civilization, it is seen as a fairly new phenomenon in Bosnia and Herzegovina. First records go back only a decade or two, in late 1990s. Basically, after the civil war in former Yugoslavia, Bosnia and Herzegovina became part of the so called “Balkan Route” used for human trafficking. In order to combat human trafficking and provide the conditions for social integration of victims of human trafficking, society needs to react with concrete strategies, programs and projects that anticipate engagement of different systems for protection of victims (police, judiciary systems, health, social protection and social welfare, education systems, NGOs, media etc.).

Vesna Sucur-Janjetovic, Associate Professor of Social Work, University of Banja Luka- Bosnia and Herzegovina and Australian College of Applied Psychology, Sydney-Australia
Social Work being one of the most important links of the social mechanism often referred to as “social response” to human trafficking in Bosnia and Herzegovina, is especially responsible for the process of re-integration of victims of human trafficking.

The main research topic was to assess the mechanisms and processes that represent “social response” via different systems involved in combatting human trafficking in Bosnian and Herzegovina (BiH) (through defined processes of identification, rehabilitation and re-integration of victims).

Operational Research Aim

Based on the knowledge on dimensions and characteristics of the phenomenon of human trafficking in Bosnia and Herzegovina, being recognized as a country of origin, transit and destination for victims of human trafficking, the research questions included the following dimensions: Phenomenology and etiology of human trafficking in context of Bosnia and Herzegovina: What are the responses of different protection systems involved in fight against human trafficking?: What are the main characteristics of an interdisciplinary approach to the phenomenon of human trafficking?: What is the development level of the social approach used: secondary (self-supporting groups and NGOs) and tertiary (local community, institution, organizations)?: What are the system solutions of social welfare systems, as assistance and support to victims of human trafficking: What is the professional perception of social workers on activities, involvement and possibilities of social work in the process of re-integration of victims of human trafficking?: What are the relations between social welfare and other services involved in providing support during the process of re-integration of victims of human trafficking?: What are the existing strategies, programs and projects on prevention, treatment and protection of victims, as well as re-integration into society?

Methodology

The underpinning tradition used for this research is mixed methodology, using best suitable methods available for data collection for both qualitative and quantitative segments of the research. The qualitative part of the research used general methods (analytical-deductive method, documentation review). The research part concerning the role of social work in the process of re-integration of victims of human trafficking was an empirical research determined to study and understand the roles of different sectors/actors in fight against human trafficking in Bosnia and Herzegovina, with special attention paid to the role of social work. Two methods were used for this part of the research: operational (for analyzing the documents contents) and survey (in the empirical part of the research). The technique used for data collection was Interview, and the instrument specially designed for this research was a survey with open and closed questions that were delivered to all Social Work Centers in Bosnian and Herzegovina. A semi/structured interview was also used for data collection from representatives (decision-makers) of police, health institutions, border protection services, social welfare services and NGOs.

Population included all Social Work Centers and municipalities’ offices for social welfare (this is in cases where municipalities are smaller in population than 2000 inhabitants). The total number of municipality Social Work Centers was 143, and 62 offices of social welfare. Every Social Work Center and Social Welfare Office had to appoint social workers that would be accountable for social welfare services in cases of identified victims of human trafficking (according to the decisions made by ministries responsible for social welfare and social policy issues (there are 12 such ministries in Bosnia and Herzegovina). Due to the specifics of the research area and complexity of the phenomenon of human trafficking, as well as the interdisciplinary approach applied in Bosnia and Herzegovina, the research included data collection using interviews with the following people: members of the National Team for Human Trafficking Combat and members of its’ Sub-teams (Action Group and BiH Council for Children), police officers, representatives of health and education institutions, NGOs and international humanitarian organizations stationed in Bosnia and Herzegovina, all dealing with issues concerning prevention, identification, treatment and re-integration of victims of human trafficking on Bosnia and Herzegovina.

Main Findings

Phenomenology and Etiology of Human Trafficking in the Context of Bosnia and Herzegovina

According to the UN Mission in Bosnia and Herzegovina (UNMIBH), human trafficking cases were first recorded in 1995. Before an organized interdisciplinary team was established at the state level, in October 2002, some figures can be found in the UNMIBH Reports, claiming that approx. 227 nightclubs and bars were opened after the war (from 1996 onwards) country wide. One document stated that in the period from July 2001 to January 2002, 2120 women and girls were interviewed by the special UNMIBH unit for combating human trafficking (IPTF – International Police Task Force). Analysis show that there were no systematical records of victims of human trafficking during the period of its “flourishing”. What makes this phenomenon statistically even more uncatchable is the fact that many official reports mention only women and girls that have received some kind of human service (assistance), prior to their deportation and repatriation (in cases of foreign victims of human trafficking) and re-integration (in cases of domestic victims). The first official Report on Human Trafficking in Bosnia and Herzegovina (2009) shows that there have been 69 identified victims of human trafficking for the purpose of prostitution (out of which 5 were males).
According to the research results, all determining factors were present in Bosnian and Herzegovina (poverty and motivation to leave the country, feminization of migration, domestic violence, labor market demands, conflicts and transition, and globalization and migrations).

**Protection Models for Victims of Human Trafficking**

Analyzed protection models were: International and National Documents; Legal protection documents for victims of human trafficking and Social Protection of Victims of human trafficking in BiH.


**Protection of Victims of Human Trafficking - Interdisciplinary Approach and the role of Social Work in suppressing human trafficking in Bosnia and Herzegovina**

The issues of protection of victims of human trafficking include: legal protection, health protection and social protection. Societal mechanisms as reaction to the phenomenon are represented through few institutional stakeholders being in constant interaction throughout different phases of service providing for the victims of human trafficking (starting with the identification phase, continuing with the treatment phase, and phases of rehabilitation and reintegration. The above-mentioned stakeholders are: National Coordinator for fight against human trafficking and illegal migrations, Regional monitoring teams comprised of representatives of law enforcement agencies, judiciary bodies, social welfare and social work centers, non-government organizations.

The role of Social Work Centers and social work in general is first and outmost seen through the role of legal guardian (as part of the legal-family protection, meaning the protection of child's best interests). Due to the lack of institutional capacities in terms of organization of accommodation and conditions for adequate rehabilitation and resocialization of victims of human trafficking, BiH institutions of social welfare have partnership with NGOs that provide such services. Therefore, the role of public institutions of social welfare is very much characterized by the legal rights services and social work is very much marginalized when it comes to the service providing for victims of human trafficking during the processes of rehabilitation and reintegration.

**Instead of Conclusions**

All etiological factors are recognizable in Bosnia and Herzegovina and therefore require a more active social and state role, in order to reduce the effects of those determining factors, and at the same time reduce the possibilities for recruitment of new victims and/or revictimization.

Social Work Centers and Social Welfare Offices exist as partners in the Interdisciplinary Approach, but only formally. The level of involvement of social workers with the victims of human trafficking depends primarily on the individual activities and motivation of social workers. This fact endangers the work of social workers, and also limits the success of the process of rehabilitation and reintegration of victims. Such approach leaves a lot of space for criticism of social work and social welfare, and at the same time, this field of social work activities does not have enough government support in comparison to its legal responsibilities.

This issue concerning the accountability and responsibility of the state and government organizations in providing support and assistance to victims of human trafficking raises few important questions: Are the victims of human trafficking (after coming out of the shelter) being integrated into society or are stigmatized and rejected, and marginalized (as prior to their recruitment in human trafficking chains)? How can social work offer adequate assistance and support during the process of reintegration if there is no institutional awareness of the problem of human trafficking?

**References**


UNOHCHR (2003), Trafficking in Human Beings in Bosnia and Herzegovina, June 2003.

UNMIH (2002), Figures for Regional STOP Teams from the formation of STOP to the present, 25 July 2001 to 5 October 2002.

“Bee My Work” was designed to simultaneously help the environment and Internally Displaced Persons/refugees by providing a sustainable livelihood to them through beekeeping work in both urban and rural areas. It aims to provide them with the ability to live independent lives in their place of refuge, which will eventually lead to self-reliance. Beekeeping provides employment, income, economic security, and it demands relatively small amounts of investment. The progress was immense. All 30 bee hives were built to perfection, and each and every one of them harbored its own bee colony; each participant had their own thriving bee colonies. The Bee My Work project was widely recognized in terms of its impactful contribution to the Azerbaijani society.

Self-employment program as a socially-oriented project in the development of human resources

One of the main functions of each state is to organize the social protection of the population, to ensure fair distribution of material benefits, to focus on the social orientation of the domestic policy and to improve the welfare of the citizens. The new challenges that emerged in Azerbaijan’s economy after 2015 have led to the reconsideration of employment policies. The program is aimed at vulnerable families, covering the entire country. The main goals of the self-employment program of the Azerbaijani state are to achieve gradual transition from the TSA to social rehabilitation, including the strengthening of social security of vulnerable families, replacement of dependence from government on self-provision, income sustainability and entrepreneurship development. One of the supportive projects for self-employee program is Baku International School’s student Kim Wan’s project “Bee My Work”.

U.A. Shafiyev, Associate, senior lecturer of chair of sociology of faculty, Social sciences and psychology, Baku State University
Self-employment is an excellent example which could be applied in many countries. As a result people become more independent. The self-employment program has a great future and we will take additional steps to implement this program. This is an important initiative to eliminate unemployment. At the same time, the number of targeted social assistance will not increase, but decrease. Those who receive this help will now be provided. It is known that targeted social assistance is the financial support provided to the vulnerable groups of the population. It is part of the government’s policy to improve the social conditions of vulnerable families. However, giving a continual form of social assistance in this way creates a passive mood in people. That’s why the government has taken serious steps to change policy in this area in recent years. These steps envisage the replacement of passive measures in the country with more active measures. As part of the self-employment program, which provides access to low-income families from low-income families in 2017, 1172 households in 76 cities and regions have succeeded in building their households. This experience has further strengthened the active direction based on the employment-oriented social protection of vulnerable families by the state with the means necessary for business. The main goals of the self-employment program of the Azerbaijani state are to achieve gradual transition from the TSA (targeted social assistance) to social rehabilitation, including the strengthening of social security of vulnerable families, replacement of dependence from government on self-provision, income sustainability and entrepreneurship development.

Today, globally, the social state, the social well-being of the state, has become a human tendency. The concept of social state has begun to find a fuller expression in the social and political theory to describe modern-day democratic state. This is also fully understood. One of the main functions of each state is to organize the social protection of the population, to ensure fair distribution of material benefits, to focus on the social orientation of the domestic policy and to improve the welfare of the citizens. Exactly for this aim, many developed or developing countries set as a goal establishing a social welfare state, which is a high level of social security, and has established it in its constitution and laws.

The state of Azerbaijan, in the way of legal and democratic development, cares about the welfare of the people and every citizen, its social protection and decent living standards, and carries out cardinal steps towards the establishment of a social state, which is the sole provider of human dignity. The President of Azerbaijan proclaims that a citizen of Azerbaijan, caring and attentive attitude to the citizens stands at the center of state policy and aims to assume that our country will be among the developed countries of the world by 2020. The “Azerbaijan 2020: Vision to Future” Development Concept, approved by Presidential Decree dated December 29, 2012, has been developed for this purpose. It is known that rapid, dynamic development of Azerbaijan since 2003 has brought our country to a great extent in the CIS and Eastern Europe for a number of socio-economic indicators.

According to the United Nations Development Program’s Human Development Report 2010, the country has moved to the “High Human Development” group of countries included in the “upper middle income” group of countries for the overall national income classification per capita of the World Bank. Today, several international organizations emphasize the desire to spread innovative social services and technologies in Azerbaijan as well as in other countries. This, of course, is proud of us. Our country is now recognized globally as a country of innovative social service ideas and humanist values.

President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, Mr. İlham Aliyev, stated in 2013 that Azerbaijan is a social state and stated that … I have repeatedly stated that and I state it again that the Azerbaijani state is a social state. Azerbaijani citizen is at the center of our policy. "It should be noted that the specific weight of social expenditures in 2018 budget expenditures confirms this. 7 billion 656.3 million manats from the state budget shall be spend on social expenditures, which is 36.6% of the state budget expenditures and 71.1% of current expenditures.

One of the main directions of social policy in Azerbaijan is provision of employment of the population, further improvement of living standards, and elimination of dependence of citizens on targeted social assistance. The state pays special attention to strengthening population, focusing on their involvement to active work, ensuring that their employment is provided and thereby maintaining a healthy position. In this regard Decree of April 7, 2016 “On Additional Measures to Ensure the Self-Employment of the Population” was adopted. The decree establishes a qualitatively new stage in the employment policy, helps unemployed and job seekers to create family businesses, to develop small and medium-sized businesses, increase their incomes through the realization of their labor potential.

As a continuation of this decree, 35 million manat of the 89 million manat allocated for the Unemployment Insurance Fund’s budget were directed to self-employment. At the initiative of the head of the state, the “ABAD”, established under the "Asan Service" brand, creates favorable conditions for the employment of young people, housewives and disabled people.

At the meeting of the Cabinet of Ministers dedicated to the socioeconomic development of the country in 2017 and the forthcoming tasks, the head of state stressed the importance of self-employment: "The successful implementation of the self-employment program we are launching recently is also expected. For this purpose, 35 million manat is envisaged and this will be a great support for about 7,000 families. The self-employment program has a great future and we will take additional steps to implement this program. This is an important initiative to eliminate unemployment. At the same time, the number of targeted social assistance will not increase, but decrease. Those who receive this help will now be provided. It is known that targeted social assistance is the financial support provided to the vulnerable groups of the population. It is part of the government’s policy to improve the social conditions of
vulnerable families. However, giving a continual form of social assistance in this way creates a passive mood in people. That's why the government has taken serious steps to change policy in this area in recent years. These steps envisage the replacement of passive measures in the country with more active measures. As part of the self-employment program, which provides access to low-income families from low-income families in 2017, 1172 households in 76 cities and regions have succeeded in building their households. This experience has further strengthened the active direction based on the employment-oriented social protection of vulnerable families by the state with the means necessary for business."

As we know, the process of improving direct social assistance mechanisms in Azerbaijan began in the early 2000s. The State Program on Poverty Reduction and Economic Development of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2003-2005, approved on February 20, 2003, defined the commitment to establish targeted social assistance (TSA) system. It should be noted that the state program also included the creation of self-employment opportunities in rural areas. Since 2005, the adoption of the Law on Targeted State Social Assistance has been possible since 2006. In accordance with the legislation, families whose the average monthly earnings per family members are lower than their need have been given right to use it.

The TSA program, along with the formation of negative habits in the society for the long-term, has weakened the activity of increasing the inclusion of the economy. The TSA is not only a viable mechanism for social protection of the population, but also a direct proportion of the economy’s dynamics, which ultimately leads to the wider extent of the negative impacts of economic fluctuations. One of the shortcomings identified during the previous years during the implementation of the TSF program is poor coverage. In spite of the fact that in remote areas, where there is a harder living environment, the low level of education and awareness, the complexity of the required procedures, and the fact that the actual poor citizen suffers from hopelessness syndrome after several attempts prevent a significant group from utilizing TSA capabilities. The above mentioned factors have once again confirmed the fact that the TSA program does not have a sustainable and quality mechanism to strengthen social welfare. Therefore, as in the rest of the world in Azerbaijan, there was a necessity to use other alternative mechanisms along with the TSA to promote sustainable social welfare. Measures to support self-employment have also been consistently implemented in order to strengthen the social security of the country along with the TSA. For this purpose, the development of human capital and adaptation to the labor market requirements, improving the quality of labor market, measures to support the development of entrepreneurship skills of small and medium-sized businesses, support for startups and programs aimed at enhancing the financial support of entrepreneurship entities, the organization of business incubators, etc.) and development issues can be especially emphasized. For this purpose, over the years, many programs targeting different social groups have been implemented, using local and foreign resources. Due to such factors as poor liberalization of the economic environment in the post-soviet period, widespread monopoly, and the development of civil business, capital has been concentrated in a number of groups and individuals, which has weakened the financial support of individual entrepreneurship in the country.

According to the State Statistical Committee of Azerbaijan, by the end of 2016 the number of economically active population in Azerbaijan was 5012.7 thousand persons, of which 4759.9 thousand were employed. According to the Committee, 31.8% of the employed population or 1514.3 thousand were employed in the reporting period. Thus, we can say that in 2016, 68.8 of the employed population belong to the self-employed population group. In the same year, the number of unemployed people was 252,800. This is 5% of the economically active population. It should be noted that according to the International Monetary Fund (IMF), unemployment in Azerbaijan was 6% in 2016.

One of the sectors in Azerbaijan's economy with the highest monthly average wage is mining, mainly based on oil and gas production. The share of this sector in the country's economy is 27.5%, while its share in employment is 0.8%. As you can see, employment in the country is poorly diversified, which further deepens inequality in income.

Thus, monthly income per capita in 2016 amounted to 257.8 manat, only 13.1 percent of which was created in the agricultural sector, providing employment of 36.3 percent of the population. This is due to the lack of income in the sector and the low quality of employment. Or 25.9% of monthly income per capita is formed from entrepreneurial activity and self-employment income. 68.8% of the employed population is included in this group.

The new challenges that emerged in Azerbaijan's economy after 2015 have led to the reconsideration of employment policies. The program is aimed at vulnerable families, covering the entire country.

The main goals of the self-employment program of the Azerbaijani state are to achieve gradual transition from the TSA (targeted social assistance) to social rehabilitation, including the strengthening of social security of vulnerable families, replacement of dependence from government on self-provision, income sustainability and entrepreneurship development.

The self-employment system has already become a target of social protection in the country aimed creating small entrepreneurship. First of all, it should be noted that there are prominent elements that distinguish the public self-employment program that has been launched in Azerbaijan since 2016 with international practice. Thus, for the first time in the world, direct financial assistance to the family (not on cash) is provided through public funds within the framework of self-employment program. The family is provided with production or service equipment in accordance with the business plan presented. In addition, analysis of similar practices of foreign countries shows that similar programs often contain measures to be considered for
work close to their homes. The work is also flexible; the equipment, as no complex technologies are needed. It is little capital investment, especially after the initial setup investment. To take up the last point, it involves very security, and it demands relatively small amounts of Beekeeping provides employment, income, economic refuge, which will eventually lead to self-reliance. with the ability to live independent lives in their place of sustainable livelihood to them through beekeeping work in both urban and rural areas. It aims to provide them with the ability to live independent lives in their place of refuge, which will eventually lead to self-reliance. Beekeeping provides employment, income, economic security, and it demands relatively small amounts of investment. To take up the last point, it involves very little capital investment, especially after the initial setup equipment, as no complex technologies are needed. It is especially suitable for women who need to carry out work close to their homes. The work is also flexible; the nature of beekeeping allows the beekeeper to choose how much time one can afford: a part-time involvement results in added income while a full-time engagement opens up a scalable business. Our goal is to create a system for training and supporting residents in selected refugee communities in the art, science and business of beekeeping.

Furthermore, instead of taxing the environment like other agricultural processes, beekeeping benefits the environment.

Our vision is to set up a scalable Model for expansion of the Bee My Work project to involve a wider section of displaced peoples, at the regional, then national, and eventually at an international scale by launching off of the project’s first session.

With this in mind, Wan Kim, the project founder, has launched the ‘Bee My Work’ project with his club in the Khojavend City Hall, Azerbaijan where six thousand Internally Displaced Persons live. The project founder visited and contacted the Khojavend City Hall on October of 2017. After a presentation on the project at the site, people of the village showed great interest and desire to engage in beekeeping as their sustainable means of livelihood. The instructor named Allahverdiyev Roman was selected to establish a curriculum and give lessons on relevant subjects with the book he wrote on the basics of beekeeping. In the practical lessons, all the participants learned how to make beehives to construct their own beehives and to raise honey bees.

In the meantime, GIVE members worked together to gather funds needed for the project; there was a waffle sale at Baku International School, and letters were sent to various organizations including the State Committee for Affairs of Refugees and IDPs of the Republic of Azerbaijan, UNHCR, as well numerous other Azerbaijani establishments calling for support, and as a result, GIVE was able to acquire recognition from multiple organizations that supported its cause through donations of varying amounts. In total, about 3,000 US dollars were raised and the 1st session of Bee My Work was able to take place using that money.

After mastering both the theoretical and practical lessons on basic Beekeeping, the project participants engaged in Beehive Construction Training, which started on the 20th of May and ended on the 31st of May, 2018, to lower costs and increase project scalability by enabling the participants to build their hives themselves. And finally, 30 Beehives were constructed. Then they were able to purchase queen bees to create Nuc colonies which they used to start the actual beekeeping process from June 6th that went on until August of 2018.

I had the opportunity to visit the village of Khojavend to check on the progress of their Bee My Work project during the summer vacation. I was warmly greeted by the Mayor of Khojavend, Mr. Eyvaz Huseynov, himself along with amazing citizens.

The progress was immense. All 30 bee hives were built to perfection, and each and every one of them harbored its own beehive; each participant had their own thriving bee colonies. There, I spent an immensely meaningful time volunteering. I also had the honor to interview the Mayor, the instructor and coordinator of the program, and the participants of the project.
The Mayor was thrilled with the progress of the project; he said it was a great success and he expressed his gratitude to me and my club. As he put it, BMW is truly meaningful as it provided participants with education on beekeeping as opposed to simply giving the hives to them and letting them figure things out on their own. The IDPs in Khojavend City Hall claimed that BMW has provided a greater opportunity to them and that they were willing to continue the beekeeping work. They were also very happy with the fact that beekeeping requires minimal labor and that the women of the household could partake while taking care of domestic affairs. The instructor added that the profits will give significantly more economic strength and confidence to the participants.

The project overall has also served to bring the participants even closer together by promoting cooperation; they relied on one another when help was needed and each served a substantial role in the beekeeping process. The instructor also worked even harder to ensure that the participants got their rightful reward for their year long journey with their hives. As a result, the bee colonies were able to prosper with ample honey and thriving populations thanks to the collective effort of their keepers. To promote the sale of the honey, the project has been broadcasted on the news section of xəzer TV, and various large supermarket chains have been contacted to grant permission to sell the products at their establishments.

This step is as vital to the project as the beekeeping process itself as it is the factor that determines the success of the program. Establishing a stable market in which the beekeepers can sell their honey in is another vital task that the Bee My Work project seeks to undertake.

There have already been multiple preorder requests from SEBA (Seoul-Baku Azerbaijan-Korean Cultural Exchange Association), HOMS (Head of Mission Spouse), and others.

The second session of Bee My Work project will soon begin from the 22nd of September which will continue until September 2019. With the success of the project, there were many IDPs applicants who wanted to take part in the second session of the project.

The Bee My Work project was widely recognized in terms of its impactful contribution to the Azerbaijani society. As a result, the project founder will be awarded by an Azerbaijani Minister, State Committee for Affairs of Refugees and IDPs of the Republic of Azerbaijan, the Mayor of Khojavend, UNHCR, and SEBA.

More than 8,000 families received targeted social assistance till self-employment program has applied. However, the implementation of self-employment programs has been started to reduce their number and to realize the ability of people to work. In parallel with targeted social assistance, self-employment programs are one of the measures that will save the state from further burdens in the future.

It should be noted that the financial aid provided by the state for self-employment is on average about 5,000 (five thousand) manats per family. State support for the establishment of family business is provided to citizens in the form of production facilities (equipment, livestock, etc.), not cash.

More than 8,000 families received targeted social assistance through self-employment. However, the implementation of self-employment programs has been started to reduce their number and to realize the ability of people to work. In parallel with targeted social assistance, self-employment programs are one of the measures that will save the state from further burdens in the future.

It should be noted that the financial aid provided by the state for self-employment is on average about 5,000 (five thousand) manats per family. State support for the establishment of family business is provided to citizens in the form of production facilities (equipment, livestock, etc.), not cash.

If in 2017, the number of families receiving targeted social assistance is 132.4 thousand, it will be possible to achieve income sustainability 5% of them within their self-employment program by 2018.

The self-employment program also has significant advantages over alternative social protection measures. Thus, the program allows parallel conclusions to be achieved for a few macro goals at the same time. In general, the advantages of the self-employment program can be classified like this:

The program has a positive impact on family to reduce dependence from external influences (decisions made by state agencies, changes to TSA terms, etc.) and increased individual initiative. Thus, the income of the family, depending on the members’ earnings and initiative, may increase the profitability of the business in the following years, so that there is no such opportunity in the passive defense mechanisms such as TSA. The reduction of dependency on the state and the weakening of negative habits (dependence on assistance, passive working habits, etc.) are also among the advantages of the self-employment program. There is no limit for building a social welfare state. Therefore, other measures aimed at strengthening social incentives should be continued.

References
1. Presidential Decree, "Order of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan on additional measures to ensure the self-employment of the population", 07.04.2016